President's Office

Planning Commission

The Stakeholders' Workshop Report on NSSDs Dialogues in Mbeya Region, Mbeya Vocational Training and Service Centre, December 1-2, 2000

Dar es Salaam December, 2000

Economic Research Bureau, University of Dar es Salaam, P.O. Box 35096, Tel. 222 (+51) 2410134, Fax: 222 (+51) 2410212, Mobile 0741-336330, E-mail: erb@udsm. ac.tz

1. Introduction

1.1 Background Information

The National Strategies for Sustainable Development (NSSDs) programme is an effort to look into the status of various strategies formulated in the country after the 1992 Earth Summit in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. The purpose is to establish the status of the strategies in terms of the content, approaches used to formulate them as well as the extent of implementation.

Thereafter, develop guidelines on how Tanzania can formulate and implement better strategies for sustainable development and how donors can assist Tanzania in this initiative.

2. Objectives of the Workshop

- (i) To review the "Stakeholders' Dialogue Report for Mbeya Region" by commenting and improving it
- (ii) To propose an ideal planning process for sustainable development

The "Stakeholders workshop time table" used in Mbeya is provided in Appendix 1, and the "Stakeholders' Dialogue Report" appears as an attachment.

3. Stakeholders' Workshop Participation

Workshop participants were drawn based on stakeholders' categories (groups) interviewed during the mini-research carried out in three districts of Mbeya Region. There are nine stakeholder categories drawn from different levels. These are presented in table 1 below.

Table 1: Stakeholder Groups Interviewed During the Mini-Research Work in Mbeya Region

Sn	Category	District/Region
1.	Regional Officials	Mbeya Region
2.	Male Farmers	Mbozi, Rungwe & Mbarali Districts
3.	Female Farmers	Mbozi, Rungwe & Mbarali Districts
4.	NGOs and Religious Institutions (Male and Female	Mbozi, Rungwe & Mbarali Districts
	together)	
5.	District Officials	Mbozi, Rungwe & Mbarali Districts
6.	Male Ordinary Citizens	Mbozi, Rungwe & Mbarali Districts
7.	Female Ordinary Citizens	Mbozi, Rungwe & Mbarali Districts
8.	Male Business, Community	Mbozi, Rungwe and Mbarali Districts
9.	Female Businesss Community	Mbozi, Rungwe and Mbarali Districts

A total of 202 stakeholders from the nine categories above were interviewed out of which 37 or 18% were invited to the workshop in Mbeya Headquarters. The following are the occupations of the invited participants.

3.1 Participants from Mbeya Regional Headquarters

- * Regional Administrative Officer
- * Regional Community Development Advisor
- * Regional Agricultural Advisor
- * Regional Wildlife Advisor
- * Regional Local Government Coordinator
- * Regional Planning Officer
- * Regional Agricultural & Livestock Officer (Statistics)
- * Regional Natural Resources Officer

3.2 Participants from Mbozi District

- ❖ District Planning Officer
- District Community Development Officer
- ❖ Coordinator of TANZAKESHO (Capacity 21) Programme
- Ordinary villagers and farmers
- **❖** Ward Executive Secretary
- ❖ NGO Representative from ADP-Mbozi
- Village based business woman

3.3 Participants from Rungwe District

- Planning Officer
- ❖ Natural Resources Officer
- **❖** Ward Community Development Officer
- Village Leaders
- Ordinary Villagers and Farmers
- ❖ Head of the Health Services NGO

3.4 Participants from Mbarali District

- District Community Development Officer
- District Administrative Officer
- Education Officer
- Village based business man
- **❖** Ward Executive Secretary
- Ordinary Villagers and Farmers

4. Methodology

The workshop was conducted using a workshop guide (Appendix 2). Discussions in the groups were based on the Focus Group Discussion (FGD) with emphasis on group consensus, followed by plenary presentations. Workshop participants were divided into four groups (Appendix 3).

Group 1: Regional Officials

Group 2: Mbarali District Participants
Group 3: Mbozi District Participants
Group 4: Rungwe District Participants

The workshop sessions were facilitated by the following:-

Prof. L.A. Msambichaka - Lead Facilitator

Mr. A. Baruti - Facilitator Dr. N.E. Mwamba - Facilitator Dr. O.J. Mashindano - Facilitator

The facilitators were assisted by the following:-

Mr. G. Remmy

Mr. I. Komba

Mr. L. Katera

Mr. M. Bigirimana

5. Major Observations

Participants reviewed the stakeholders' dialogue report as true reflection of the situation of planning for sustainable development in the country. In response to the issues raised in the workshop guide, various useful observations were made. These observations are a translation from Kiswahili version.

5.1: Indicators for Sustainable Development

Sn	Indicator	Regional	Mbozi	Rungwe	Mbarali
1.	Growth of per capita income (Ward Bank)	~	~		
2.	To be able to obtain basic needs through the household income	~	~		
3.	Economic growth being greater than population growth	•	•		
4.	Improvement in social services	~			
5.	Improvement of infrastructure such as roads, communication network, transportation and energy	•			
6.	Capability of the stakeholders to plan and implement development plans	•			
7.	Protection and conservation of the environment and natural resources for the future generations	~	~		
8.	The level of technology in production and provision of services	~			
9.	Increase of the capability to conduct	~			

	research and make use of the output				
10.	Increase in the average life expectancy	~			
11.	Decline in infant mortality rate	~			
12.	Level of understanding in the				~
	community				
13.	Participation of the community at				~
	different levels including children		~		
14.	Good governance, skills and				~
	knowledge				
15.	Contribution in development projects				~
16.	Existence of by-laws and laws				~
17.	Acceptance of a development project				~
18.	Presence of passable roads and bridges			~	
	throughout the year				
19.	Increase in good nutrition			~	
20.	Increase in the production and use of		~	~	
	bio-gas technology				
21.	Increase in the number of secondary			~	
	schools				
22.	Increase in agricultural production			~	
23.	Good and permanent houses, use of		~		
	traditional herbs in preserving food				
	crops, use of natural and traditional				
	fertilizers				
24.	A good plan for land use i.e for		~		
	agriculture, forestry, pasture and				
	housing				
25.	Crop marketing groups		→		
26.	Participation of women in the village		~		
	government (30%)				
27.	Increase in knowledge of planned			~	
	child bearing				

5.2: Constraints in Planning for Sustainable Development

Sn	Constraint	Regional	Mbozi	Rungwe	Mbarali
1.	Unbearable and excessive poverty	~			
2.	Lack of support from decision makers	~			
3.	Community not knowing their right in	~	~		
	participation during planning for				
	development				
4.	Politicians' interference in the plans for	~			
	sustainable development				
5.	Difficulties in promoting development in	~			
	villages				
6.	Lack of resources	~			
7.	Lack of enthusiasm from the technocrats	~			
	due to lack of incentives				
8.	Lack of capital			~	~

9.	The weather condition				~
10.	Lack of adequate skills and knowledge		~	~	~
11.	Low technology				~
12.	Inadequate infrastructure				~
13.	Laws that do not take into consideration the stakeholders' interests				~
14.	Policies that do not take into consideration the stakeholders' interests		~		~
15.	Corruption				~
16.	Tough/difficult conditions from donors		~		~
17.	Lack of political will				~
18.			~	~	~
19.	Inadequate information about plans (research)				~
20.	Unavailability of inputs that are of good quality			~	
21.	High cost of production compared to crop prices			~	
22.	Lack of reliable market for selling crops that are produced within the district			~	
23.	Low government budget			~	
24.	Poor coordination in development plans		~		

5.3: Enabling Environment for Planning for Sustainable Development

Sn	Conditions	Regional	Mbozi	Rungwe	Mbarali
1.	Acceptance of the plans for sustainable development by those who have the capability to make them prosper/successful	~			
2.	Community should be capable of understanding and using their right to participate in formulating plans for sustainable development	~	~		•
3.	Politicians should not to interfere with the plans for sustainable development	~			
4.	Accessibility to rural areas	~			•
5.	Availability of resources	~			
6.	Existence of technocrats with enthusiasm to implement their responsibilities through incentive schemes	~			
7.	Capital for the stakeholders through contributions				•
8.	To formulate laws and policies that take into consideration the interests of the stakeholders		~		~
9.	Transparency				~

10.	Political will			>
11.	Abolishment of culture and habits that prohibit development			>
12.	Projects Management			>
13.	Security and management of the people and their assets		>	
14.	Knowledge	>		
15.	Availability of assets and financial resources	*		

5.4: Capacity Building Demands in the Planning Cycle

Sn	Areas requiring capacity building	Regional	Mbozi	Rungwe	Mbarali
1.	 		~		•
2.	/		•	•	
3.			~		
4.				~	
5.	Involvement of women in planning, implemention and decision making so as to increase efficiency in different activities and projects			•	

5.5: Strategies for Sustainable Development

S	n Strategy	Regional	Mbozi	Rungwe	Mbarali
1.	To provide educational knowledge to the	~	Agreed		Agreed
	village community and the officials		with the		with the
			report		report
2.	To improve policies and target them into	~			
	participatory planning				
3.	To alleviate poverty through "Ward Plan"				
	"Mpangokata" which has a goal of	~		~	
	alleviating poverty by involving the				
	community				

5.6 Comments

5.6.1 General Comments and Observations

- (i) There is a notable variation between the regional views and district views.
- (ii) There is variation in the observations between the three districts. For example, while the regional authorities recognize Sn 1 to Sn 11 in section 5.1 to be important indicators of sustainable development, Rungwe and Mbarali districts do not see them to be important. The second example can be depicted from section 5.3 where Sn 7 to Sn 12 appear to be important conditions and/or enabling environment for Planning for Sustainable Development to Mbarali district, but they do not seem to be important conditions to the regional authorities as well as Mbozi and Rungwe districts.
- (iii) The discrepany in observations by the districts could be explained by the difference in the development levels between the three districts, but also the fact that at the national level and lower levels the structure of the planning process and the planning implementation framework appears to be not clear. For example, the planning guidelines used by regional as well as district planners are issued annually by two different government institutions namely, the Ministry for Regional Administration and Local Government and the Ministry of Finance. That apart, the two planning guidelines are also said to be different thus creating two different planning frameworks or processes at regional as well as district levels.

5.6.2 Specific Comments and Observations

A. District Characteristics

- (i) Rungwe district is relatively wealthier than the other two districts
- (ii) Mbozi district is relatively wealthier than Mbarali district
- (iii) Mbarali district is less wealthy

B. Common Indicators for Sustainable Development

- (i) There is enormous discrepany between districts in the identification of indicators for sustainable development
- (ii) There is only one common indicator for Mbozi and Mbarali, namely; "Participation of the Community at different levels including Children"
- (iii) There is only one common indicator for Mbozi and Rungwe namely; "Increase in the production and use of the bio-gas technology"

C. Common Constraints in Planning for Sustainable Development

There are two constraints which were identified by all the three districts as constraints in planning for sustainable development.

- (i) Lack of adequate skills and knowledge
- (ii) Culture and habits that are not good and gender discriminating.

D. Enabling Environment for Planning for Sustainable Development

Two factors were common to Mbozi and Mbarali and none was common with Rungwe. The common factors for Mbozi and Mbarali were:

- (i) Community should be capable of understanding and using their right to participate in formulating plans for sustainable development
 - (ii) To formulate laws and policies that take into consideration the interests of the stakeholders.

E. Capacity Building Demands in the Planning Cycle

- (i) Mbozi and Mbarali pointed out the need for capacity building in "project formation"
- (ii) Mbozi and Rungwe identified a need for capacity building in "project implementation, management and monitoring".

F. Strategies for Sustainable Development

The provision of education was considered an important strategy for sustainable development by Mbozi and Mbarali districts.

6. Workshop Evaluation

- (i) Generally, the workshop organization as well as the objectives as reported by participants were very good and relevant respectively.
- (ii) A few participants thought the time given for discussing the Mbeya Region Stakeholders' Dialogue Report was not adequate.
- (iii) Participants suggested that:-
 - (a) the reports should be distributed to them well in advance.
 - (b) the venue for the workshop should be at the district level so that some activities can be viewed.
 - (c) it is wrong to exclude the youth in the entire process of executing the NSSDs dialogues, as youth can make a very productive group of stakeholders during the NSSDs dialogue process. This is particularly true bearing in mind the fact that they are an important segment of the future generation.

7. They Way Forward

After the Mbeya Mini-Research and Stakeholders Workshop, the following need to be accomplished before the Bolivia Workshop.

- ❖ The Revised Stakeholders' Dialogue Report for Mbeya Region with Workshop contributions
- ❖ The Arusha Mini Research and Stakeholders' Workshop
- The Arusha Stakeholders' Dialogue Report incorporating workshop contributions
- ❖ The National Stakeholders Workshop
- ❖ The NSSD Dialogue Final Report
- ❖ The Dialogue Steering Committee Meeting
- The Bolivia Workshop

President's Office Planning Commission

Appendix 1: Workshop on Stakeholders' Dialogue on National Strategies for Sustainable Development (NSSDs)

Mbeya Vocational Training and Service Centre December 1st -2nd, 2000 Time Table

Day	Time	Event	Responsible
Friday 1.12.2000	8.00-8.30	Registration	Lead Team
	8.30-8.45	Oganizational Issues	Lead Team
	8.45-9.00	Guest of Honour Arrives	Workshop Chairperson
	9.00-9.10	Opening Remarks by Guest of Honour	Mr. Baruti Workshop Chairperson
	9.10-9.30	Briefing on the Dialogues	Dr. Mwamba/Dr. Mashindano
	9.30-9.40	Workshop Guide	Prof. Msambichaka
	9.40-9.45	Moving into Groups	Lead Team
	9.45-10.30	Group Discussion Commences (Step 2 (i) 2 (iii))	Group Chairpersons
	10.30-11.00	Tea/Coffee Break	Time Keeper
	11.00-13.00	Group Discussions (Step 2(i)-2 (iii))	Group Chairpersons
	13.00-14.00	Lunch Break	Time Keeper
	14.00-15.00	Plenary Presentations by Groups (Step 2(i) – 2(iii))	Workshop Chairperson
	15.00-16.30	Group Discussions (Step 2(iv) – 2(viii))	Group Chairpersons
	16.30-17.00	Tea/Coffee Break	Time Keeper
	17.00-18.00	Group Discussions $(Step \ 2(iv) - 2 \ (viii))$	
	18.00	End of Day One	Private
Saturday 2.12.2000	8.00-10.00	Group Discussions and Preparation of Flip Charts (Step 2(iv) – 2 (viii))	Group Chairpersons
	10.00-10.30	Tea/Coffee Break	Time Keeper
	10.30-13.00	Plenary Presentation	Workshop Chairperson
	10.30-11.00	Group A (Mbozi)	Group Chairperson
	11.00-11.30	Group B (Rungwe)	Group Chairperson
	11.30-12.00	Group C (Mbarali)	Group Chairperson
	12.00-12.30	Group D (Regional Reps)	Group Chairperson
	12.30-12.45	Wrap-Up	Prof. L.A. Msambichaka Team Leader
	12.45-12.50	Workshop Evaluation	Lead Team
	12.50-13.00	Closing Remarks	Workshop Chairpersons

President's Office Planning Commission

Appendix 2: Workshop Guide

Mbeya Vocational Training and Service Centre

December 1-2, 2000

Workshop Guide

1. Objective of the Workshop

- (i) To review the "Stakeholders' Dialogue Document" by commenting and improving it
- (ii) To propose an ideal planning process for sustainable development

2. Procedure for Group Discussion and Reporting

2.1 Step 1: Moving into groups

The Workshop participants will go into groups as follows:-

Group		Advisor
1.	Mbeya Regional Office	Mr. Baruti/Dr. Mwamba
2.	Mbarali District	Dr. Mashindano/Dr. Mwamba
3.	Mbozi District	Dr. Mwamba/Mr. Baruti
4.	Rungwe District	Mr. Baruti/Dr. Mashindano

2.2 Step 2: Reviewing "Dialogue Report" and Discussion on Sustainable Development

Participants in each group will review the document, discuss and report with the help of examples where necessary on the following:-

- (i) Comments and improvements on the "Dialogue Report"
- (ii) Criteria for sustainable development: economic, social and environmental
- (iii) Strengths and weakness of the current planning system
- (iv) Constraints to planning for sustainable development
- (v) Basic conditions necessary for planning for sustainable development
- (vi) Strategies for planning for sustainable development
- (vii) An ideal planning process for sustainable development at local and district level (present diagram/chart)
- (viii) Areas in the planning cycle where capacity is most needed and type of capacity needed at local and district level
- (ix) Any other important issue/comment or recommendations on planning process for sustainable development

2.3 Step 3: Plenary

Each group will present the above issues in the plenary

3. Out Put

Proposed "Planning Process for Sustainable Development in Mbeya Region"

Appendix 3: Stakeholders' Workshop Participation List in Mbeya Region (1st and 2nd of December, 2000)

1	Jackson Simbeye	-	A farmer
1. 2.	Jiscard Silindu	_	A farmer
3.	G. Mpina	_	Representative of Agricultural Development Project
			(ADP) – Mbozi
4.	Michael Mahenge	-	A farmer Village
5.	Sophia Mwashitete	-	Business Community
6.	Mariam Simbeye	-	A farmer
7.	Sabina Ruila	-	A farmer
8.	A. Chambo	-	Community Development Officer
9.	D. Mwanyika	-	Coordinator TANZAKESHO Project
10.	E.A. Aluka	-	Planning Officer
11.	Mr. Kita	-	Ward Executive Secretary
12.	Emmannuel Mohamed	-	Villages Leader and farmer
13.	Raphael M. Ngeka	-	A farmer
14.	Veronica Tukonge	-	A farmer
15	Agnes Elikunda	-	Ward Community Development Officer
16	Adolf Mapunda	-	District Planning Officer
17.	Eunis Mbilinyi	-	District Official
18.	Twebako Mwakalalile	-	NGO
19.	Sekela Mwambimbi	-	A farmer
20.	Magreth Bukuku	-	An Ordinary Citizen
21.	Wilsoni Mwasambamba	-	Village Extension Officer
22.	Kenneth A. Ndingo	-	Village Based Business Man
23.	Susana Mponzi	-	Local Government
24.	Benjamin Ndondole	-	A farmer
25.	Ruth Siwanga	-	Village Business Community
26.	Mayasa Madabis	-	A farmer
27.	J.A. Mwakasege	-	District Community Development
28.	Mrs. I. Ndimbo	-	District Official
29.	Mr. T.T. Nzunda	-	District Administrative Officer
30.	Mr. K. Mwanjati	-	Regional Administrative Advisor
31.	Mr. A. Luvanda	-	Regional Community Development Advisor
32.	S.L. Munishi	-	Regional Official
33.	J.J.S. Kitangalala	-	Regional Agricultural Advisor
34.	S. Ally	-	Planning Officer
35.	L. Matozi	-	Local Government
36.	Mr. Mmbaga	-	Regional Official

Workshop Secretariat

Prof. L.A. Msambichaka - **Team Leader**Mr. A. Baruti - Facilitator
Dr. O.J. Mashindano - Facilitator
Dr. N.E. Mwamba - Facilitator