

**PAKISTAN'S NATIONAL
CONSERVATION STRATEGY:
RENEWING COMMITMENT
TO ACTION**

Report of the Mid-Term Review

by

Arthur J. Hanson
Stephen Bass
Aziz Bouzaher
Ghulam M. Samdani
with the assistance of
Maheen Zehra

November 2000

ABOUT THIS REPORT

This report was prepared by the External Review Team (ERT) and is based on findings of the Team, including other results from the Pakistan National Conservation Strategy Mid-term Review (MTR). The main period of work took place during 1999-2000. Comments were received between July-November 2000. This final version was completed in November 2000.

**PAKISTAN'S NATIONAL CONSERVATION STRATEGY:
RENEWING COMMITMENT TO ACTION**

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	2
Table of Contents	16
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	19
ACRONYMS	21
CHAPTER 1. MEETING THE CHALLENGE OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN PAKISTAN	23
Introduction	23
Fundamental Constraints	24
Costs of Inaction	25
Urgency of Response	26
Conclusion.....	27
CHAPTER 2. THE NCS REVIEW.....	29
The NCS Review and Final Report	29
NCS Context 1980-2000	30
Early Implementation Perspectives	30
Linkages: Environmental Sustainability, Economic Growth, and Poverty Reduction	32
NCS Focus during Implementation.....	33
How the NCS was to be Implemented.....	34
Constraints on Environmental Action during NCS Implementation	35
General Analytical Framework for the NCS Review	36
Evaluation Criteria	37
MTR Analysis Approach.....	38
Constraints and Limitations in Conducting the Review.....	39
CHAPTER 3. NCS IMPACTS 1992 – 2000	41
NCS and the Political Economy of Conservation in Pakistan	41
Creating New Space and Coalescing Agendas.	41
The Role of Policy Communities in Shaping NCS in the Future.....	42

Awareness Raising	43
Shaping Institutions in Government, Civil Society and the Private Sector	46
Pre-NCS Institutional Framework: A Brief Overview	46
NCS Institutional Vision	46
Institutional Shaping 1992-2000	47
More Effective Institutional Performance is Needed.....	51
Assessing Outcomes.....	51
ERT Subjective Assessment of NCS Program Outcomes/Outputs.....	52
Potential Success Stories	53
Provincial and District Conservation Strategies	57
Gender Integration	63
Public Consultations	64
Monitoring, Reporting and Evaluation (MRE).....	65
NCS Today and in the Future.....	68
CHAPTER 4. FINANCING AND MANAGING NCS	69
Financing the NCS	69
Self-financing Mechanisms	70
Management of the NCS Implementation Process	71
Within Government Ownership and Leadership for the NCS	72
NCS Ownership and Leadership Outside of Government.....	73
CHAPTER 5. THE CHANGING CONTEXT	75
National Factors	75
An Evolving National Economic Context	75
Evolving National Political Context and Devolution	76
Localization Meeting Globalisation—Finding the Balance	77
Conclusion.....	78
CHAPTER 6. THE WAY FORWARD	79
General Guidelines for NCS-2	79
Vision, Scope and Content.....	82
Goal-setting and Participation	83
Drivers, Actors and Links.....	84
NCS-2 Activities	85
Management, Coordination and Monitoring.....	87

Innovation and Investment.....	89
Timing, Process and Product	90
CHAPTER 7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	91
A Glass Half-empty or Half-full?	91
Conclusions – Five Key Lessons Learned and Views about the Future	92
Recommendations	99
ANNEXES	114
Annex 1. Terms of Reference for the Mid-term Review of the Pakistan National Conservation Strategy.	114
Annex 2. Pakistan National Conservation Strategy Mid-Term Review – External Review Team Members	120
Annex 3. Analytical Framework for MTR Assessment as Proposed by MTR Committee.	122
Annex 4. Key Activities and Commissioned Studies for the NCS MTR.	123
Annex 5. List of Persons Consulted by NCS MTR (ERT)	125
Annex 6. Field Visits by External Review Team Members.....	131
Annex 7. Achievement of NCS Outputs by 2001.	136
Annex 8. Financing of the NCS	141
Annex 9. Government of Pakistan Devolution Plan.	143
Annex 10: Bibliography.....	145

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The Pakistan National Conservation Strategy Mid-term Review (NCS-MTR) exercise has been primarily funded by CIDA. Through its PEP funding, CIDA supported the overall operational costs of the NCS MTR, four studies, and participation of the external review team leader Dr. Arthur J. Hanson, as well as Dr. Ghulam M. Samdani. The participation of Dr. Stephen Bass at the design stage was supported by the Department for International Development UK (DFID). NORAD also has supported his participation. The World Bank funded the Environmental Strategy Background Report prepared by SDPI. Dr. Aziz Bouzaher from the World Bank, Washington is a member of the external review team. The Swiss Development Cooperation (SDC) has funded the participation of Dr. Stephen Bass in the external review mission. UNDP has supported studies on institutional development and resourcing for NCS implementation. All are thanked for their support and cooperation. CIDA is also thanked for providing useful input of Mr. Bruce Goodman of Cowater Canada and Mr. Ian Smillie PEP Performance Advisor who developed the first draft NCS MTR terms of reference.

The NCS MTR team is extremely grateful to all the Secretaries, Additional Secretaries and Joint Secretaries, Director Generals at the federal and provincial level and officials in AJK and the Northern Areas who took time out to meet with the MTR team and provided extensive input to the information collection process. The participation of Section Officers, Research Officers, Technical Officers, and Forest Officers during the public consultation workshops provided for meaningful discussion. Acknowledgments are due for participants of focus group workshops for NGOs and private sector. The non-governmental and private sector bodies providing inputs are thanked for their contributions.

Special gratitude is extended to the four PEP partners who guided the MTR exercise through continued participation. The members of the PEP Steering Committee for the NCS MTR provided all out support and technical backstopping that ensured the timely delivery of MTR targets. The NCS Unit took the lead in the MTR, Mr. Aziz Qureshi of the Environment Section of the Planning and Development Division provided technical support in the development of a database for MTR. SDPI prepared a background paper on Environmental Strategy that is recognized as an important building block for NCS MTR. Acknowledgements are due also to the IUCN offices in Gilgit, Quetta, Peshawar, and Karachi for technical input as well as extensive operational and secretarial support. The IUCN Islamabad office is specially acknowledged for making arrangements for travel and logistics of MTR team at every stage. Special thanks are due to the Manager PEP and Head of IUCN Islamabad, Dr. Asif Ali Zaidi for his conceptual input, technical backstopping and management support to the process.

This opportunity is also taken to extend gratitude to Minister Omar Asghar Khan and the officials of MELGRD. The former Secretary of MELG&RD, Mr. Sikandar Hayat Jamali who took personal interest in the MTR process and made himself available for workshop in Quetta. The present Secretary of MELGRD, Mr. Shafqat Ezdi Shah, has been extremely supportive throughout the process. The former Joint Secretary MELG&RD Mr. Hafeez Ur Rehman played the key role in setting the ball rolling for NCS MTR. The Joint Secretary NCS, Mr. Naseer Ahmed, and the Director General of Pakistan EPA, Mr. Asif Shuja Khan are thanked for guidance and support. Special thanks are extended to Mr. Asad Sibtain, Deputy Secretary NCS Unit MELGRD for facilitating the whole MTR process.

Acknowledgements are due to Hagler Bailly Pakistan, Arshad Zaman Associates, Mr. Haroon Ayub Khan, an independent consultant, Dr. Aamir Matin and Mr. Aqil Shah of UNDP and Mr. Akhtar A. Hai of Karachi University, Tariq Banuri and Shaheen Rafi Khan, for preparing MTR studies.

Throughout the entire effort the NCS, MTR Coordinator Ms. Maheen Zehra performed a difficult task in a remarkable fashion. She deserves the heartfelt thanks of all involved in this review. The ERT members wish to signal our deep appreciation of her capable, hard work and intellectual contributions.

We appreciate the time taken by various individuals and organizations that provided comments on the draft MTR report. While the information gathering and much of the analysis has been a very collective effort, the content of the report is the responsibility of the principal authors.

Arthur J. Hanson (External Review Team Leader)
Stephen Bass
Aziz Bouzaher
Ghulam M. Samdani

ACRONYMS

ACS	Additional Chief Secretary
AD	Assistant Director
ADP	Annual Development Plan
AJK	Azad State of Jammu and Kashmir
AKRSP	Aga Khan Rural Support Programme
AS	Additional Secretary
BCS	Balochistan Conservation Strategy
BEPA	Balochistan Environmental Protection Agency
CBOs	Community Based Organizations
COs	Community Organizations
DD	Deputy Director
DFA	Deputy Finance Advisor
DFID	Department for International Development UK
DG	Director General
DS	Deputy Secretary
EAD	Economic Affairs Division
ECNEC	Executive Committee of National Economic Council
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
EPD	Environment Protection Department
EPRC	Environmental Protection and Resource Conservation Project
ERNP	Environmental Rehabilitation in NWFP and Punjab Project
ETPI	Environmental Technology Programme for Industry (Pakistan Chamber of Commerce)
EU	European Union
FA	Finance Advisor
FFEJ	Frontier Forum for Environmental Journalists
FRC	Frontier Resource Centre
FSMP	Forestry Sector Master Plan
GEF	Global Environment Facility
GM	General Manager
GNP	Gross National Product
GoB	Government of Balochistan
GoNWFP	Government of North West Frontier Province
GoS	Government of Sindh
GoPunjab	Government of Punjab
GoP	Government of Pakistan
HDIP	Hydrocarbon Development Institute of Pakistan
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
IISD	International Institute for Sustainable Development
I&D	Irrigation and Drainage Department
IUCN	The World Conservation Union
JICA	Japan International Cooperation Agency
JS	Joint Secretary
KANA	Kashmir Affairs and Northern Areas Division
MACP	Mountain Areas Conservancy Project
MRE	Monitoring, Reporting and Evaluation
MinFAL	Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock
MELGRD	Ministry of Environment, Local Government and Rural Development
MoELGRD	Ministry of Environment, Local Government and Rural Development
MoWD	Ministry of Women Development

MTR	Mid Term Review
NA	Northern Areas
NACS	Northern Areas Conservation Strategy
NCS	National Conservation Strategy
NCSU	National Conservation Strategy Unit
NDP	National Drainage Programme
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NIO	National Institute of Oceanography
NSDP	National Sustainable Development Programme (UNDP)
NWFP	North West Frontier Province
OGSP	Oil and Gas Sector Programme
P&D	Planning and Development
PC1	Project Concept 1
PE&DD	Planning, Environment and Development Department
PEP	Pakistan Environment Programme
PEPA	Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency
PEPA	An Act to Provide for the Protection, Conservation, Rehabilitation, and Improvement of the Environment, for the Prevention and Control of Pollution, and Promotion of Sustainable Development (Act No. XXIV of 1997)
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSDP	Public Sector Development Plan
SAP	Social Action Programme
SD	Sustainable Development
SDNP	Sustainable Development Networking Programme
SDPI	Sustainable Development Policy Institute
SO	Section Officer
SPCS	Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy
Sungi	
TA	Technical Advisor
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNIDO	United Nations Industrial Development Organization
VOs	Village Organizations
WWFP	World Wide Fund for Nature Pakistan