

**Mid-Term Review of  
National Conservation Strategy**

# **Mass Awareness Initiatives**

**Final Report**

HBP Ref.: D0B01NCS

**February 16, 2000**

**IUCN Pakistan**

Islamabad

# Contents

---

<b>1. Introduction</b> .....	<b>1-1</b>
<b>1.1 Background</b> .....	<b>1-1</b>
<b>1.2 Scope of Work</b> .....	<b>1-1</b>
<b>1.3 Methodology</b> .....	<b>1-2</b>
<b>1.4 Contributors to the Report and Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>1-4</b>
<b>1.5 Organization of the Report</b> .....	<b>1-5</b>
<b>2. Mass Awareness Envisaged in Conservation Strategies</b> .....	<b>2-1</b>
<b>2.1 The Pakistan National Conservation Strategy</b> .....	<b>2-1</b>
<b>2.2 What the NCS Says About Mass Awareness</b> .....	<b>2-2</b>
2.2.1 The NCS Communications Strategy .....	2-3
2.2.2 The NCS Education Strategy .....	2-4
<b>2.3 What Provincial Strategies Say About Mass Awareness</b> .....	<b>2-6</b>
2.3.1 The Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy (SPCS).....	2-6
2.3.2 The Balochistan Provincial Conservation Strategy.....	2-11
2.3.3 The Northern Areas Conservation Strategy .....	2-13
2.3.4 The Azad Jammu and Kashmir Conservation Strategy .....	2-14
2.3.4 The Punjab Conservation Strategy .....	2-15
2.3.5 The Sindh Conservation Strategy .....	2-15
<b>3. Communicating the NCS</b> .....	<b>3-1</b>
<b>3.1 Communications Initiatives Linked to the NCS</b> .....	<b>3-2</b>
3.1.1 Public Sector Initiatives.....	3-2
3.1.2 Private Sector Initiatives .....	3-4
3.1.3 NGO Initiatives .....	3-4
<b>3.2 Environmental Education Initiatives under the NCS</b> .....	<b>3-7</b>
3.2.1 Public Sector Initiatives.....	3-8
3.2.2 Private Sector Initiatives .....	3-9
3.2.3 NGO Initiatives .....	3-10
<b>4. Recommendations for the MTR</b> .....	<b>4-1</b>
<b>4.1 Communications</b> .....	<b>4-1</b>
4.1.1 Press .....	4-2
4.1.2 Television and Video Production.....	4-2
4.1.3 Radio .....	4-2
4.1.4 Other .....	4-2
<b>4.2 Environmental Education</b> .....	<b>4-2</b>

## Exhibits

---

<b>Exhibit 2.1:</b>	Broad NCS Messages in Key Areas.....	<b>2-16</b>
<b>Exhibit 2.2:</b>	Summary of Communication Policies and Measures .....	<b>2-17</b>
<b>Exhibit 2.3:</b>	Summary of Education Policies and Measures .....	<b>2-18</b>
<b>Exhibit 3.1:</b>	Press Coverage of Environmental Issues from 1992-1999.....	<b>3-11</b>
<b>Exhibit 3.2:</b>	Allocation of Funds for the “Environmental Awareness through the use of Mass Media” Project.....	<b>3-12</b>
<b>Exhibit 3.3:</b>	Awareness Raising Campaigns .....	<b>3-13</b>
<b>Exhibit 3.4:</b>	Universities and Institutions Offering Environment Programs .....	<b>3-15</b>

## Abbreviations and Acronyms

---

AKRSP	Aga Khan Rural Support Programme
BCS	Balochistan Conservation Strategy
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency
EUAD	Environment and Urban Affair Department
HBP	Hagler Bailly Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd.
IUCN	The World Conservation Union (Formerly the International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources)
JRC	Journalists Resource Centre
MTR	Mid Term Review
NEQS	National Environmental Quality Standards
NCS	(Pakistan) National Conservation Strategy
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PEPC	Pakistan Environmental Protection Council
PFEJ	Pakistan Forum for Environmental Journalists
SPCS	Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy
SDPI	Sustainable Development Policy Institute
TOR	Terms of Reference
WWF-P	World Wide Fund for Nature-Pakistan



# 1. Introduction

---

## 1.1 Background

The Pakistan National Conservation Strategy (NCS) is the primary document designed to encourage sustainable development, conserve natural resources, and improve efficiency in the use and management of resources. The formal implementation of the NCS started after its approval by the federal cabinet in March 1992, although some measures were already under way in 1991, with allocations in the federal budget. Based on an extensive consultation process, 68 specific programs in 14 core theme areas were identified. Long-term goals and results expected by the year 2001 were set for each core theme area.

A committee was formed in 1998 to make arrangements to undertake a mid-term review (MTR) of the NCS. The goal of the MTR is to enable the stakeholders (government, civil society and supporting institutions) to assess the current status of NCS implementation and to take necessary steps for mid-course corrections. The World Conservation Union (IUCN) is the executing agency for the MTR.

The specific objectives of the MTR are to:

- ☞ Assess the progress achieved in the implementation of the NCS since its adoption, taking into account all the factors influencing the implementation
- ☞ Analyze and collate lessons learnt so far, draw conclusions, and formulate recommendations for making the NCS a holistic and integrated strategic guideline for sustainable development in Pakistan.

The NCS review committee identified 13 specific tasks for achieving these goals. One of these tasks entails reviewing mass awareness on environmental/conservation issues. Hagler Bailly Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. (HBP) was engaged by IUCN-Pakistan to conduct this study, which is presented in this report.

## 1.2 Scope of Work

In its review and analysis of changes in Pakistan's environmental legislation and their impact on sustainable development, Hagler Bailly was guided by the following TORs:

- ☞ Prepare a list of the key stakeholders in the mass awareness campaigns on environmental issues and sustainable development, such as:
  - ⌘ Public institutions, in particular, the Ministry of Environment
  - ⌘ Federal and provincial departments
  - ⌘ Environmental protection agencies (EPAs)—national and provincial
  - ⌘ Private sector institutions
  - ⌘ NGOs

- ⌘ Donors
- ⌘ Media (electronic) PTV, PBC, STN, FM100, etc.
- ⌘ Press (print media)
- ⊕ Collect information on mass awareness/awareness raising initiatives undertaken by the key participants of the environment and sustainable development scene
- ⊕ Collect and analyze data on the mode/channel of awareness raising and its effectiveness
- ⊕ Collect information on environmental and sustainable development issues that were highlighted through mass awareness
- ⊕ Collect information on programs/schemes/interventions undertaken as a result of mass awareness on environmental issues
- ⊕ Collect and analyze data on institutional reforms/changes caused by mass awareness on environmental issues, such as the establishment of the NCS Unit Ozone Cell
- ⊕ Collect information on the resources available/allocated to mass awareness initiatives by such as private and public sectors, NGOs, donors, etc.
- ⊕ Analyze and link projects initiated as a result of mass awareness campaigns
- ⊕ Collect and analyze information on environmental education initiatives undertaken by provincial conservation strategies
- ⊕ Collect and analyze information on institutional changes pertaining to environmental education
- ⊕ Collect information on alliances formed between public and private sector institutions on environmental education and mass awareness on environmental issues.

### 1.3 Methodology

The methodology HBP adopted for this study is briefly outlined below.

At the outset, HBP identified the parties that had played key roles in or were involved in initiatives for mass awareness regarding environmental and conservation issues. This information was obtained from the following sources:

- ⊕ The NCS Unit, and its provincial counterparts
- ⊕ Members of the print and electronic media
- ⊕ NGOs and NGO libraries
- ⊕ The Ministry of Environment, Local Government and Rural Development and federal and provincial EPAs
- ⊕ Donor agencies
- ⊕ Market research organizations

- ⊞ Organizations involved in environmental education.

From these sources, HBP collected a representative sample of data on awareness initiatives related to environment and conservation. During data collection and discussions with these institutions, HBP focused on obtaining information about:

- ⊞ Pressing sustainable development concerns that have regularly been covered in the media
- ⊞ The issues that have been highlighted in awareness drives, and for which programs or interventions have subsequently been undertaken
- ⊞ Environmental issues for which institutional reforms have been undertaken as a result of mass awareness campaigns
- ⊞ Concerns that have brought about attitudinal changes in the general public
- ⊞ Issues involving environmental education
- ⊞ Topics that have led to institutional reform in environmental education as a result of mass awareness.

### **Data Analysis**

The NCS will be the first point of reference while analyzing the data collected. HBP will review the Strategy to consider its stipulations about advocacy of environmental and conservation issues. This review will provide a focus for the subsequent data analysis. Alternatively, it could reveal that the NCS does not provide specific guidance in the area of awareness creation. In the latter case, the review will help achieve an important objective of the MTR—improving or rectifying any gaps in the NCS document.

This analysis will primarily entail ‘desk research,’ though some visits will be made to institutions that possess records of mass awareness drives, or to organizations that have themselves undertaken awareness raising initiatives. These visits will provide an opportunity to gain direct knowledge of the methods of awareness raising employed and any impacts these drives may have had, and for discussions with people who have been involved in awareness-raising and its aftermath.

In the course of the analysis, HBP has tried to:

- ⊞ Determine the trends of time/coverage allocation by the media to environmental mass awareness (The degree to which the national press and electronic media cover topics on sustainable development will determine how much priority the public accords it.)
- ⊞ Assess the link between mass awareness and change in public attitude
- ⊞ Provide a basis for determining whether, in the context of Pakistan, the media is a practical vehicle for change
- ⊞ Determine if the coverage of environmental issues is proportionate to actions implemented subsequently
- ⊞ Assess the extent to which the media is used for awareness raising
- ⊞ Compare the reach of the mass media with the public’s actual use of it



- ⑥ Determine the impact of environmental education on attitudinal change in society
- ⑥ Determine which topics highlighted in awareness initiatives are being incorporated in initiatives, and which are ignored.

### ***Preparation of Report***

The findings of the study will be documented in a report. In the report, the major participants of the mass awareness drives will be identified, the significant environmental issues highlighted will be pinpointed, and any subsequent interventions and changes in public attitudes recorded. Then, the results of discussions will be compiled, and the information collected will be analyzed to assess the issues raised in the TORs.

### **1.4 Contributors to the Report and Acknowledgements**

The report has been prepared by Omayma Khan, Senior Analyst in HBP's Environmental Programs unit. Mr. Vaqar Zakaria, Managing Director, HBP reviewed the draft of the report and provided valuable comments.

The IUCN was actively involved in the preparation of this report. The following persons, in particular, provided valuable assistance:

- ⑥ Dr. Asif Ali Zaidi, Head, Islamabad Office
- ⑥ Ms. Maheen Zehra, NCS Coordinator
- ⑥ Ms. Nargis Alavi, Head IUCN-Karachi
- ⑥ Ms. Dhunmai Cowasjee, Head, Communications Unit
- ⑥ Mr. Ali Raza Rizvi, Head, Education, NGO and Gender Program
- ⑥ Mr. Umer Afridi, Coordinator, Communications Unit.

Critical information was obtained through discussions with the following persons:

- ⑥ Dr. Syed Asif Hussain, Director, Environmental Protection Department, AJK
- ⑥ Fayyaz A. Khan, Deputy Director, Information, Education and Communications, Population Council
- ⑥ Seema Malik, Director, Teachers Resource Centre.

The support provided by the resource persons at the following libraries is also greatly appreciated:

- ⑥ IUCN, Islamabad
- ⑥ SDPI, Islamabad
- ⑥ HBP, Islamabad.

Editorial services at HBP were provided by:

- ⑥ Ms. Rumina Iftikhar
- ⑥ Ms. Kiren Khan.

## 1.5 Organization of the Report

**Section 2** (*Mass Awareness Envisaged in Conservation Strategies*) of this report reviews the NCS document and its provincial counterparts to discuss the strategies outlined or undertaken for implementation of the NCS programs. The specific initiatives that have been carried out for mass awareness of sustainable development have been illustrated in **Section 3** (*Communicating the NCS*). Finally, **Section 4** (*Recommendations for MTR*) provides a guideline to the MTR team for analyzing the mass awareness component of the NCS.



## 2. Mass Awareness Envisaged in Conservation Strategies

---

### 2.1 The Pakistan National Conservation Strategy

The Pakistan NCS is a broad-based policy statement aimed at achieving environmentally sustainable economic and social development in Pakistan. The three overriding objectives of the NCS are:

- ⊕ Conservation of natural resources
- ⊕ Sustainable development
- ⊕ Improved efficiency in the use and management of resources.

Three operating principles have been identified to achieve these objectives. These are:

- ⊕ Greater public participation in development and environmental management
- ⊕ A merging of environment and economic decision-making
- ⊕ Lasting improvements in the quality of life.

The NCS was developed over a nine-year period (1983-1992) through the collaborative efforts of the IUCN and the Government of Pakistan. The NCS development process included extensive consultation with a large number of experts, interested individuals, communities, NGOs, and government agencies. The final product, according to several observers, is outstanding, in terms of both comprehensiveness and quality.<sup>1</sup>

The NCS sets out the basic guidelines for an integrated effort aimed at protecting the environment and the natural resources of the country. This broad framework provides a comprehensive point of reference for all agencies, departments, private sector companies, financial institutions, and donor agencies for undertaking systematic efforts to bring about an effective change for sustainable development.

The NCS has three main parts:

Part 1, *Pakistan and the Environment*, provides the context of the document. A comprehensive discussion on the state of the environment in Pakistan is followed by discussions on resource use, existing institutions, policies, instruments and environment-related programs.

Part 2, *Elements of National Conservation Strategy*, starts by defining the basic objectives and principles of the NCS as discussed earlier in this section. This is followed by a comprehensive discussion of issues and opportunities in the primary sectors (agriculture, forest management, rangeland rehabilitation, livestock management, water

---

<sup>1</sup> *Pakistan: Support to the Implementation of the National Conservation Strategy, Stage I*, Final Report, Sweco, April 20, 1993.

resources, marine and coastal resource management, fisheries, wildlife and their ecosystem, and mineral resources). After this, the issues and opportunities in the secondary and tertiary sectors (energy, industrial development, human settlement, pollution control, recreation and tourism) are presented, followed by a discussion on supporting programs (population, education, communications, research and technology, women in development, training and environmental information systems).

Part 3, *Implementation Arrangements*, provides the action agenda and implementation strategy. The NCS has 14 program areas for priority implementation. These are:

1. Maintaining soils in croplands
2. Increasing irrigation efficiency
3. Protecting watersheds
4. Supporting forestry and plantations
5. Restoring rangelands and improving livestock
6. Protecting water bodies and sustaining fisheries
7. Conserving biodiversity
8. Increasing energy efficiency
9. Developing and deploying renewables
10. Preventing/abating pollution
11. Managing urban wastes
12. Supporting institutions for common resources
13. Integrating population and environment programs
14. Preserving the cultural heritage.

Within the 14 program areas, 68 specific programs have been identified. For each program, the long-term goals, and expected outputs and physical investments required within the first 10 years of implementation have been identified. The NCS proposes a seven-level strategy for implementation. The seven levels are federal and provincial leadership, departmental responsibility, district coordination, community participation, individual action, corporate tasks, and government and NGO support. The required government and institutional development, the role of community organizations, and the financial support required for the implementation of the NCS are also discussed.

## **2.2 What the NCS Says About Mass Awareness**

The NCS lays stress on creating greater awareness about the environmental problems and their solution in Pakistan. Channels of communications and education have been developed and invested in by both the private and public sector to target players who are important for achieving this end. Hence, mass awareness in the context of the National Conservation Strategy and, in turn, sustainable development, carries within it the components of communications (which includes the print and electronic media) and environmental education.

Mass awareness is relevant to all priority areas of the NCS. Though the requirement is of a general nature it is vital for achieving the objectives of the strategy's 14 core areas. The NCS has outlined some broad messages that need to be disseminated for each of these areas. These are presented in **Exhibit 2.1**.

The ultimate aim of the NCS mass awareness drive is to bring about a behavioral change in the masses. To achieve this aim, it was decided that consolidated strategies would be developed to implement initiatives for mass awareness. These strategies were to be developed by the Journalists Resource Centre (JRC) and by the Education Unit at IUCN, the author of the NCS.

### 2.2.1 The NCS Communications Strategy

The media has enormous power to influence society. Unfortunately, this ability is wasted in Pakistan as its coverage is usually superficial and it is seen as a tool of the government, which breeds cynicism amongst the end-users. The information presented is almost entirely biased and includes very little analysis.

In a society that has a 45 percent literacy rate,<sup>2</sup> the print media targets an elite that is not a representative sample of the population. However, radio is a successful medium that accesses the largest and most diverse social audience. It “covers the whole country, broadcasting 300 hours of programming a day in 21 local and 15 international languages. It cuts through the literacy barrier and is particularly effective in reaching rural female audiences. Radio should thus be the leading environmental medium in Pakistan, with due attention to regional variations in language, traditions and culture.”<sup>3</sup>

To ensure that a planned, comprehensive, coordinated approach using the most appropriate medium is used to generate awareness of the NCS, it was thought necessary to draw up a strategy for communications. It was hoped that this strategy would help avoid the traditional *ad hoc* focus on reactive publicized solutions to environmental problems, and instead create a systematic support for effecting behavioral change. Adil Najam of the NCS secretariat makes recommendations for this behavioral change in his prescriptive study, *Communicating Conservation*. According to him, behavioral change does not just support the NCS environmental awareness campaigns—it *is* the NCS. In order for the communication process to be truly effective, it must empower individuals and communities by educating them on the issues of sustainable development.

“A communication strategy is therefore an essential prerequisite to intelligent planning and implementation. It does not preclude mistakes; it simply improves the chances of success.”<sup>4</sup>

Together, the traditional and non-traditional components of Pakistan's media have immense potential for information dissemination if they are utilized intelligently (The non-traditional components would include, for example, the *ulema* [religious scholars])

---

<sup>2</sup> Government of Pakistan, Finance Division, Economic Auditors Wing, *Economic Survey*, 1999.

<sup>3</sup> IUCN-Pakistan, *Where We Are, Where We Should Be, and How to get There, A concise and popular version of the National Conservation Strategy*, 1995.

<sup>4</sup> IUCN, *The NCS Communication Strategy*, 1995.

and the *jirga* [local discussion groups]). Unfortunately, the media have rarely been managed by professionals or trained practitioners. More often than not, journalists, advertisers and even television producers enter the field without any formal training. The result is a media that is weak in its planning and ineffective in its deliverables. A major reason for this is lack of investment, a common problem in the public sector, which is also there to some extent in the private sector.

Hence, training in communications is vital to the success of the NCS strategy. As there is a lack of experts and trained expertise in Pakistan, the Communications Strategy advocates investing in or mobilizing institutions in communication training. This would involve simple training courses on communication as a process—including, for instance, drawing, photography, puppetry, and street theatre—as well as more advanced training, such as television production, concept development, etc.

The strategy emphasizes the need for incorporating indigenous knowledge into training. Although this is a vital need, it is often neglected. Messages that are meaningful and can be applied to the real life of the target audience will make the crucial connection between the communicator and the target audience. For this, message development needs to be audience-driven rather than expert-driven. Consultation involving all stakeholders prior to message development will ensure both a two-way flow of information and, eventually, the required audience response.

**Exhibit 2.3** summarizes the strategy's communication policy and planned initiatives.

### **2.2.2 The NCS Education Strategy**

The NCS emphasizes the need for reform and alignment throughout Pakistan's education system by incorporating sustainable development into the curriculum. It advocates the need to strengthen the education system at all levels, targeting not only students, but educationalists as well.

Apart from the non-formal sector, the NCS recognizes three distinct levels of formal education—schools, colleges and universities. The higher levels of education impart expertise, whereas junior levels of education create awareness or formally introduce the concepts and concerns of environmental protection. The lack of curricular support is compensated through activities such as tree-plantations, recycling projects, clean-ups, etc.

At the secondary level, science subjects such as chemistry and biology have components relevant to the environment, as does geography, which comprises topics like population, agriculture, mining, etc. The NCS advocates strengthening these components and highlighting their relevance to sustainable development. At the undergraduate level, environmental components should be reinforced in the zoology and botany programs. The same applies to engineering and medicine courses. Recently, the Punjab University introduced a diploma in environmental science, while Kinnaird College initiated a masters in environmental science. These will add to the existing courses on agriculture, applied zoology, livestock management, wildlife, etc., in the country. The NCS plan of action for curricula in all areas is to revise, restructure and update.

The NCS strategy for the formal education sector addresses the needs of primary college and university students. It suggests that non-formal activities be targeted at the preschool child and adults, who are not covered in the formal education sector.

Based on these approaches, the NCS sets out very clear objectives of education on sustainable development. They are to help civil society:

- ⊕ Become aware of and sensitive to the environment and its allied problems
- ⊕ Acquire basic knowledge about the environment, its associated problems, and humanity's critical presence and role in it
- ⊕ Learn skills for anticipating, avoiding, and solving environmental problems
- ⊕ Develop the ability to contribute and evaluate environmental policies, measures, and programs
- ⊕ Develop a sense of responsibility and urgency leading to direct participation in appropriate environmental actions.

Apart from this, the NCS clearly outlines policies and measures it feels are necessary to incorporate environmental education into formal and non-formal education. These are listed in **Exhibit 2.2**.

However, despite the above mentioned objectives, policies and measures, an environmental education strategy has not been devised for the NCS. This appears to be mainly because the nature of environmental education is not widely understood. Through discussions, it was learnt that environmental education is not considered part of the continuum of mass awareness that begins with communications and ends with environmental education. As this basic concept was never explained explicitly, in the NCS or any other document, mass awareness has become synonymous with communicating via the mass media only.

In addition, the curriculum of the formal education sector is so rigidly defined that environmental education has been unable to penetrate it. In fact, it appears that the Ministry of Education considers environmental education to be the mandate of the Ministry of Environment. Initially, neither government agency accepted this responsibility and the concept of environmental education lost its significance.

The NCS Unit convinced the Ministry of Education that the subject was vital to the curriculum. Ideas to set up a task force for designing a curriculum for the subject were floated. The issue was given considerable thought and training workshops were held with educators. Subsequently, it was felt that although the workshops provided excellent input to teachers, actually internalizing what was learnt so that it was reflected in day-to-day teaching would be nearly impossible as the teachers could not fit their new knowledge into the existing teaching schedule. It was thought that a separate subject would be an added burden in the already overcrowded curriculum and, in order for environmental education to be relevant to real life natural resource use, it should be incorporated into existing subjects such as biology, geography, Islamiyat, etc.

Unfortunately, this has also not been done, and pressure is still being applied to incorporate environmental education in the national curriculum. Recently, the Curriculum Wing of the Ministry of Education decided that the subject "General



Science” will, in future, be termed Environmental Education. In this way, environmental education will only have to be incorporated into one subject. To date, this arrangement has not been finalized.

Although environmental education seems to have been largely ignored at the national level, it has not been overlooked at the provincial level. All provincial and local strategies that have so far been developed have considered it a priority. Rural areas have given the topic greater weightage than their urban counterparts.

## **2.3 What Provincial Strategies Say About Mass Awareness**

Once NCS implementation was in place, the next logical step was to develop provincial strategies. The first of these was the Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy (SPCS). While the NCS concerns initiatives and approaches that are general and wide-ranging, the provincial strategies are more specific, tailored to the norms and culture of each province.

### **2.3.1 The Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy (SPCS)**

The North West Frontier Province (NWFP) was the first province to make a specific commitment to implementing the NCS. The provincial bureaucracy, keen to prepare a document based on its own key concerns, such as forests and water resource management, developed what is thought to be a model amongst provincial strategies. The SPCS is considered by its authors, to be more advanced than the NCS as it involved greater public consultation during formulation, including all stakeholders, ie, government, NGOs, the private sector, and district and village communities. It is the first instance of the government visiting people to discuss issues pertaining to the environment.

Though the NCS discusses the importance of mass media, it, surprisingly, ignores environmental education. Education is discussed, but not specifically environmental education. However, the SPCS has devoted a complete and comprehensive chapter to both mass media and environmental education. The SPCS even contains its own communications and education strategy. This was developed not only to inform the people of NWFP about the SPCS, but also to outline a set of priorities relevant to NWFP, based on the priorities of the people and not the experts.

Although no empirical research has been done so far on the level of environmental awareness in NWFP, the district and village level public consultations undertaken to develop the SPCS proved that lack of environmental awareness is a fundamental problem that needs to be addressed. Along with the conventional tools of mass awareness, such as the print and electronic media, the SPCS public consultation process employed more traditional methods to spread information about sustainable development. The *hujra* (a daily meeting for male members of society), the *jirga* (the traditional decision making forum of society), and the *godar* (area where women draw water and where they go to purchase daily bread) were all used for holding discussions and providing education on environmental protection.

In 1994, the SPCS undertook a pilot public awareness project designed to test the SPCS communications strategy. Stage plays, workshops for radio and television producers,

writers, and journalists were held with the result that a Roundtable was formed with all these participants providing input into the formulation of the SPCS Communications Strategy. This highlighted the importance of non-traditional methods of media such as street theatre and puppetry, in publicizing issues.

Of the formal media, radio is the most powerful, reaching out to almost all of NWFP's population. Though more people are gaining access to television (around 48 percent now), it is still a luxury of the middle and upper classes. The cinema is the third most important medium, which is particularly popular during the weekends when many come into the city to see a movie. The print medium is limited to the educated population—the total circulation of English, Urdu and Pushto newspapers is under 100,000 in the province.<sup>5</sup>

Although mass awareness drives on the environment are increasing, they are nonetheless irregular. It was felt necessary to develop a communications strategy which would pool all the existing activities and forge them into a systematic approach with an objective. Therefore, the SPCS Support Unit at IUCN-Peshawar hired a Communications Officer who developed a working paper in consultation with the communities and communications professionals concerned with the environment, such as radio producers, drama writers, etc. A workshop was held and a roundtable for communications was formed consisting of these professionals. A communications strategy was developed, and the members of the roundtable assumed ownership of it.

### **Communication**

The SPCS Communications Strategy aims to create awareness of sustainable development issues and an understanding and acceptance of the SPCS among the people of NWFP. This will create an informed public that supports and helps implement the SPCS. The Strategy proposed to undertake specific activities for key audiences such as provincial line departments, parliamentarians, NGOs, *ulema*, formal and non-formal media, industry, federal government and donor agencies, armed forces and the general public. Each sector has a three-year activity plan laid out, with some long-term initiatives. Of these initiatives, the most innovative and also the most effective media tool was that of the *ulema* (religious scholars and clerics). The *ulema* are perhaps the province's most influential sector of society, and hence the most important vehicle for bringing about behavioral change. The vast network of mosques, approximately one to every 30 households (*pers. comm.*: Fayyaz A. Khan), makes them the most extensive medium of communication, especially in the rural areas. (See **Section 3.1.3**)

Although the SPCS has a separate education strategy, the communications strategy also contains an education component. It aims to bring the younger generation into the environmental movement, who can then, in turn, reach those sectors of society that are inaccessible by mainstream media.

As the province lacks a specialist library on sustainable development, the strategy also envisages setting up an Environmental Information Management Centre (EIMC) to support environmental reporting, education and research. The EIMC will provide the

---

<sup>5</sup> IUCN, *SPCS Communication Strategy*.

necessary support to the SPCS and will cater for the needs of government, NGOs, media and educational institutions. It will contain:

- ☉ A central library/documentation/information center;
- ☉ An audio visual program;
- ☉ A development resource promotion unit;
- ☉ A training and management section; and
- ☉ Rural information centers.

Once the center is established in Peshawar, district branches will be set up to reach rural areas and other districts of the province where it can also work as a catalyst in motivating people to contribute to sustainable development.

A workshop has been held with the stakeholders of the EIMC. Representatives of NGOs, the media, academia and the government met to agree on the main principle, from which a Steering Committee on the EIMC was developed. The committee has so far developed a concept paper. However, after the departure of the IUCN Coordinator Communications—who has not yet been replaced—this initiative was not taken further.

The communications roundtable, on its own initiative, produced a drama based on the environment. The writer and the local PTV General Manager were both members of the roundtable, which facilitated the development subsequent airing of the production. The result was a drama entitled *Shaakhsaal*, meaning branch or result. This helped sensitize other members of the electronic media to problems relating to the environment and environmental themes and messages were built into many subsequent teleplays.

To build media capacity, the communications strategy emphasized training journalists on environmental reporting. So a Sarhad forum for environmental journalists was formed, which was a precursor to the national Pakistan Forum for Environmental Journalists (PFEJ). This project trained journalists in Peshawar on how to keep the debate on sustainable development alive. Subsequently, the forum initiated a project in which its members visited different regions and imparted training to local journalists and reporters. This forum continued to grow strong and eventually sought its own funding outside of the SPCS.

However, like the NCS Communications Strategy, the SPCS could not persuade the provincial government to adopt ownership of this communications strategy. This was primarily due because the NWFP government did not have any in-house capacity to undertake the SPCS. Despite its being a focal point for the SPCS in all the government's line departments, the SPCS could not penetrate the government, which is considered a major weakness of the strategy.

### ***Environmental Education***

An education strategy was not specifically commissioned in the NWFP. It was through the process of public consultation that the need for such a mechanism became a priority. After the completion of the SPCS, its education strategy had still not been finalized. As this strategy will eventually be incorporated into the provincial education program, it was

thought essential to 1) hire a focal point to liaise with the Education Secretariat, and 2) to prepare educational tools in order to develop the full strategy.

Education reform efforts are hampered by complicated bureaucratic requirements. The federal government is responsible for updating and changing textbooks and curriculum development, while the provincial governments are in charge of textbook production.

The provincial education department, like its federal counterpart, has suggested that environmental education should be merged into existing subjects on the curriculum and not taught as a separate subject. It was thought that environmental education should ideally strengthen other subjects.

The SPCS states that if environmental education is to be truly incorporated into the NWFP education system, the education department will have to be strengthened to the extent that it becomes self-sufficient in this type of education and its associated disciplines, such as geography and biology. Training in material design, curriculum development, textbook production and teacher training will need to be provided.

At the school level, some institutions have established Environment and Wildlife Clubs for their students, which undertake informal activities such as competitions and functions. NGOs are also active. The Pakistan Environmental Protection Foundation (PEPF) has conducted training for teachers in environmental education, as has the In-service Training Unit (ISTU), a Peshawar based forum for teachers' education. Other NGOs are involved in tree plantation campaigns and in establishing nurseries.

The Education Unit formed a roundtable with representatives from the government education sector and private sector, parents, private education, rural development and environmental specialists to discuss issues related to merging environmental education into the curriculum.

Again, like the Sarhad Communications Strategy, there are problems with the Education Strategy. Difficulties in hiring an Education Officer have delayed much of the strategy initiatives, and, as with the national education strategy, getting the government's cooperation has proven to be difficult.

### ***Monitoring and Evaluation***

The SPCS sets out specific activities to monitor the effectiveness of its communications strategy. These are:

- ⑥ A sample survey amongst various target groups to determine their present understanding of the environment and related issues
- ⑥ Concurrent monitoring of the activities under the communications strategy
- ⑥ Repeat sample surveys once every two years, amongst the target audience, to assess the changes in understanding and attitudes and to determine how these changes relate to the implementation of the communications strategy
- ⑥ Regular adjustment of the strategy as a result of regular monitoring.

In addition to this, the SPCS sets various goals for its mass awareness component. Some of these have to be achieved within three years of implementation. For the purpose of

this MTR, it is these that are relevant; the remaining long-term objectives fall beyond the range of this study. The short-term goals are to:

- ⑥ Conduct the survey mentioned above
- ⑥ Establish an EIMC
- ⑥ Have SPCS focal points in key government departments
- ⑥ Hold regular inter-departmental briefings on sustainable development within government departments
- ⑥ Arrange roundtables with provincial cabinet members
- ⑥ Persuade parliamentarians to form a House Committee on the Environment
- ⑥ Train a corps of *ulema* on environment so that they can impart training to others
- ⑥ Hold *hujras* between the Deputy Commissioner, NGOs and the communities to discuss environmental issues
- ⑥ Train and support a group of writers, journalists, puppeteers, artists and singers to present environmental issues through their work
- ⑥ Support the creation of a forum for environmental journalists
- ⑥ Bring the boy scouts and girl guides into the campaign for environmental protection and awareness
- ⑥ Develop information packs for key players in the SPCS plan of action
- ⑥ Train and build the capacity of NGOs and community based organizations (CBOs) to disseminate information on the environment
- ⑥ Establish a cell in the Sarhad chamber of commerce to train businessmen on the NEQS
- ⑥ Involve the local armed forces in the environmental initiatives
- ⑥ Produce a documentary on the environment of NWFP
- ⑥ Conduct fortnightly briefings for journalists
- ⑥ Broadcast environmental messages on television and radio
- ⑥ Get *ulema* training schools to include environment in their curricula.

For its education component, the SPCS sets out commitments that have to be achieved in three years. The current status of these initiatives will measure the effectiveness of this strategy. These commitments are to:

- ⑥ Recruit a focal point for environmental education work in the Education Department
- ⑥ Establish an Environmental Education Roundtable
- ⑥ Establish a planning and management group in the Education Department
- ⑥ Select demonstration districts to pilot test the education strategy
- ⑥ Hold an orientation session for the Director Education and key staff members

- ⑥ Design, initiate and evaluate training for key players in environmental education
- ⑥ Test an environmental education curriculum for inclusion in the Primary Teaching Certificate and Certificate of Teaching courses
- ⑥ Develop, test and replicate an environmental education component
- ⑥ Participate in workshops/seminars on strategic planning for environmental education
- ⑥ Initiate ‘greening’ of literacy and basic education activities
- ⑥ Include environmental education into the Chitral Conservation Strategy
- ⑥ Develop links between environmental education focal points and other strategy projects of the NCS.

### ***The Chitral Conservation Strategy***

Since this Strategy is currently in its draft stage, HBP was unable to acquire a copy of it.

### ***The Abbotabad Conservation Strategy***

As this Strategy is currently in its consultation and development stage, HBP was unable to acquire any information on it.

### **2.3.2 The Balochistan Provincial Conservation Strategy**

The Balochistan Conservation Strategy (BCS) is still in its draft stage. Because it has not been finalized and implemented, its effectiveness cannot be assessed right now. This is different from the case of the SPCS, where initiatives had already begun before the document was ratified by the government. At the time of this study, the strategy was still seeking donors for its implementation, which is the primary hurdle in its undertaking. However, some initiatives relevant to environmental education and communications are in place, which can support the BCS’s mass awareness component.

Communications and education is an important independent program of the BCS. The strategy recognizes that extensive support is required for this program, for which effective mechanisms should be set up in the government’s environment related departments or in the private sector.

The strategy has registered a growing interest in the environment, based on the increase in the number of schools, NGOs and private sector institutions currently involved in raising awareness on the environment. There is also a greater concern in the province’s media to highlight environmental concerns of both national and provincial interest. Unfortunately, both financial and human resources are constrained, and hence the level of awareness raising is not as high as that of the SPCS.

Like the SPCS, the most practical form of mainstream media for BCS is radio. It reaches out regularly to 87 percent of the target audience while the print media can only access about 3-4 percent. Boosters have recently been installed at various points in the province

and now 70 percent of the population can receive Pakistan Television broadcasts.<sup>6</sup> But the effectiveness of this medium for mass awareness depends on whether the population can afford or access it.

Balochistan is a less developed province of Pakistan. Taking into account its resource constraints, poor outreach, gender disparities, the nascent state of its NGO sector, and its socioeconomic structure, it appears that awareness can best be raised here through non-formal channels of communication. The BCS acknowledges that *ulema, jirgas, melas* (festivals), street theatre and industrial exhibitions (fruit shows, handicraft exhibitions) would be useful platforms for awareness raising.

Unlike the SPCS, Balochistan lacks both a strong network of NGOs and an effective bureaucracy. At the time this report was written, funds for the strategy's implementation had not been secured. This will not only check its implementation, but will also limit its scope. It will only be possible to outline the precise activities after funds become available. Until then, proposals of activities in the communications and education strategies will remain flexible and general.

The strategy sets out needs for communications and education, focusing primarily on:

- ⊕ Raising awareness and educating tribal leaders and other local opinion leaders about environmental issues and sustainable resource use
- ⊕ Building the capacity of staff in the government, media and NGO sector who will be involved in environmental education and communication
- ⊕ Raising environmental awareness and promoting participation of local women's groups in all education and communications consultations
- ⊕ Making optimum use of funding
- ⊕ Incorporating environmental communications and education in all development initiatives at the provincial and local community level.

These needs are coupled with the following general initiatives, which will be tailored to the province's particular program of action under mass awareness:

- ⊕ Orientation and capacity improvement of of personnel of both formal media (print and electronic) and informal media through meetings, workshops and training courses
- ⊕ Institutionalizing the environment subject in formal and non-formal education through training of master trainers, curricula development, teaching, and extra-curricular activities, eg, nature clubs.
- ⊕ Developing and implementing sector and theme specific environmental communications and education programs.

These initiatives fall within the strategy's short-term goal of generating awareness in environmental issues and constituency building, and its long-term goals of enhancing the

---

<sup>6</sup> IUCN, *Balochistan Conservation Strategy Draft*, 1999.

capacity of key stakeholders and institutionalizing sustainable development principles into Balochistan's education and communications sector.

A strategy for education, which will comprise a communications strategy, is due for completion in June 2000. Although these two sectors are merged, there is a communications strategy specifically for publicizing the BCS itself.

### **2.3.3 The Northern Areas Conservation Strategy**

The Northern Areas Conservation Strategy (NACS) is currently being developed, although some activities, particularly those related to environmental education, are already under way.

#### ***Environmental Education***

In 1992, the Aga Khan Rural Support Program's (AKRSP) Forestry Section, wishing to raise awareness on sound forestry practices, established nature clubs in some of its schools in Gilgit. The Education Unit at IUCN was contacted for aid in material development and training for nature club leaders. The two organizations held a workshop on training and development of material, following which six government schools and five Aga Khan Education Services (AKES) Schools established Nature Schools in their institutions. Four teachers (three from the government and one from AKES) were nominated to become resource persons for the Nature Clubs, and were given training.

In 1995, the AKRSP decided that it should no longer take the lead role in this sector, and that either a government institution or the AKES should take up the initiative. An IUCN team visited the Northern Areas to assess whether there was potential for facilitation of environmental education by local organizations. Surprisingly, many organizations responded positively, including several local NGOs, such as WWF, which has a regional environmental education program; the Directorate of Education; the Aga Khan Development Network; and local schools.

As discussed earlier, the Ministry of Education has not formally introduced environmental education into its curriculum, although, in 1997, the then Minister for Education, Anita Ghulam Ali, gave a clear policy statement to this effect. At the provincial level, this process is much more advanced, especially in the Northern Areas and NWFP.

Again, as with the SPCS, environment related activities in the education sector had already begun prior to the strategy's formulation and implementation. Hence, some of the activities, such as incorporating environmental education into a BEd course at a local college, can be taken.

The NACS hired an Education Coordinator who undertook preliminary needs assessments and scoping exercises of the education sector to develop an education strategy. Exploratory meetings with stakeholders and data collection on the formal and non-formal education systems were vital components of his work. A strong working relationship has been established with the Northern Areas Education Department.

At the time this report was written, a preliminary education strategy had been developed and circulated for internal review.



## **Communications**

In 1998 the NACS Unit hired a Communications Coordinator, who has since been identifying key stakeholders and developing awareness raising materials. A communications roundtable has been formed which includes members from the electronic media and press. To generate understanding and awareness about the NACS amongst the stakeholders, civil society and partners, various activities have been carried out under the strategy, including the publication of informative articles and workshops and briefings for the media.

An initial draft of the NACS Communications Strategy has been prepared and is being internally reviewed. The Communications Interest Group will table the draft for discussion once it is set up.

### **2.3.4 The Azad Jammu and Kashmir Conservation Strategy**

The Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) Conservation Strategy is currently in its development stage, therefore, HBP could not obtain the strategy document. However, through discussion with the Director, EPD-AJK, it was learnt that a short-term strategy for mass awareness has been in place since October 1999, and will continue till June 2000. Before its termination, a consultant will be hired in March using UNDP funds, to devise a comprehensive long-term strategy. Like the BCS, the AJK conservation strategy will encompass both communications and environmental education. Also, like the BCS strategy, it will be a broad framework of initiatives tailored to the needs of the province at the time of implementation.

AJK's official population is 3 million, of which 700,000 have migrated overseas, leaving a population of approximately 2.3 million. Of these, 57,000 are teachers and 25,000 are civil servants (*pers. comm.*: Dr. S. A. Hussain). Therefore, for any mass awareness strategy to target a large relevant section of the population, in the case of AJK, the education and government sector must to be targeted.

Under the short term strategy currently in place, mass awareness activities undertaken so far include school debates, a weekly environmental program on the local television channel, two weekly environment programs on the radio, regular newspaper coverage, and distribution of leaflets and pamphlets. The school activities also include setting up of environmental groups, which will be a focal point for the AJK Conservation Strategy.

The local Extension Services Management Academy provides training for professionals working in community development. With assistance from the implementers of the AJK short-term mass awareness strategy, the academy delivers a component on environmental issues in each training exercise it conducts. This training is conducted by EPD personnel. Local government institutions such as district and union councils are also trained in raising awareness of environmental issues. In addition, they are given motivational training to persuade rural communities to, for instance, avoid the use of plastic bags and boil water for human consumption.

Environmental education is not currently a direct activity of the strategy. The school curriculum is based on the federal curriculum, and environmental education will only be included when a national revision of the school curriculum is undertaken. However,

indirect environmental education activities do take place, such as the school debates mentioned earlier. A major reason for this deficiency is the institutional and financial weaknesses of the local EPD, which is currently administering the strategy. Until last September, the EPD had only one staff member and very limited resources. Since then only three more personnel have been hired. Hence, the department does not have the capacity to carry out more environmental activities.

#### **2.3.4 The Punjab Conservation Strategy**

A conservation strategy for the Punjab province has not yet been devised. The government has to invite an agency to devise a strategy and, so far, it has not made any such request. However, despite this, mass awareness initiatives have been undertaken in the province. The presence of organizations such as WWF-P and the Society for the Advancement of Higher Education (SAHE), coupled with strong Forest and Wildlife Departments, ensures that the environmental agenda is addressed. Although there is no formal provincial strategy, these organizations, and others, use the NCS as a framework for their work. In fact, mass awareness and environmental education initiatives are significant in this province.

#### **2.3.5 The Sindh Conservation Strategy**

As with the Punjab Conservation Strategy, the provincial government has not yet commissioned the Sindh Conservation Strategy. However, as in Punjab, mass awareness initiatives are under way, and have been so for some time, due to the presence of a regional WWF-P office and IUCN's head office in Karachi.

**Exhibit 2.1: Broad NCS Messages in Key Areas**

<i>Area</i>	<i>Message</i>
Natural Resources	Sustainable use is somewhat analogous to spending the interest on your money while keeping the capital. A society that insists that all natural resource use be sustainable ensures that it, and the next generation, will benefit from those resources virtually indefinitely.
Human Settlements	The sustainable solution to the problems of expanding urban and rural settlements lies in participative community development.
Population	Unsustainability in population can only breed unsustainability in development and rob future generations of a chance for an existence with meaningful choices.
Energy	Society needs to become more energy-efficient and to develop renewable resources in a sustainable manner.
Industry	If you do not conserve at first, development will not last. Environmental pollution does have a cost, and its prevention does have benefits—both social and economic, long-term and immediate.
Biodiversity	All species have a right to survive, not just because they provide us with natural products and the potential of new sources for food and medicines, but also because this establishes a principle for the survival of all species, including humans. In variety lies not just the spice but the fount of life.
Mining	There is value in using non-renewable resources efficiently, with minimum waste, as opposed to senselessly using up this wealth as if there were no tomorrow.
Laws and Institutions	Environmental laws should be followed, environmental institutions should be well managed, and environmental research should be cost-effective.

**Exhibit 2.2: Summary of Communication Policies and Measures**

Policies	Gear environmental communications to specific audiences, messages, and media
	Make sustainable development a national communication priority of the government.
	Mobilize forces within the conventional media and beyond to communicate greater environmental awareness and concern.
	Make communication on these issues a priority in institutions dealing with conservation and environment.
Measures	Use radio as the lead medium for environmental communications at the grassroots level.
	Consider regional variables such as language, traditions, and culture in all environmental communications
	Encourage celebrities and opinion makers to take up the cause of sustainable development
	Encourage the media to interact with the government and NGOs and to undertake investigative environmental stories.
	Set up information dissemination units in all government environment and conservation institutions.
	Encourage the development of NGOs committed to environmental communication, and of information units within major environmental NGOs.
	Duplicate institutions like the JRC and PFEJ and increase their scope and reach to all media professionals.
	Research, document, and communicate the cultural and religious bases of environmental conservation.

**Exhibit 2.3: Summary of Education Policies and Measures**

Policies	Focus on sustainable development in the entire system of formal education and at all levels. Let education on sustainable development grow from within the existing system rather than be added to it.
	Adopt a holistic perspective to environmental education.
	Center sustainable development education on practical problems relating to the student’s immediate environment.
	Aim at instilling ethics of conservation.
	Launch comprehensive non-formal education programs to reach that large segment of population not presently reached by education because of either poor access or literacy problems.
	Incorporate sustainable development issues into all relevant non-formal education programmes.
Measures	Revise the general science course at the primary and middle school levels, at private as well as public schools, to take better account of areas of environmental relevance.
	Add essays, stories, and articles on environmental themes in all language courses.
	Add environmental components to the compulsory course of Pakistan Studies in secondary schools, at the intermediate and bachelor’s level, and at professional education institutions, and revise all optional courses to include such topics.
	Encourage environmental co-curricular activities focussed on rural issues in village schools and urban ones in the cities, and, wherever possible, devise curricula to best suit the students’ actual environment.
	Develop a functional glossary of environmental terms in Urdu and regional languages.
	Revise subjects now being offered at the intermediate and bachelor’s level with a view to restructuring syllabi to incorporate areas of environmental relevance, and offer ‘Environmental Science’ as an optional subject.
	Add environmental components through new subjects and restructured curricula to specialized bachelor’s degrees in subjects such as population, forestry, and agriculture.
	Restructure and streamline courses at agricultural and engineering universities, at medical colleges, and in master’s programs to include relevant environmental components.
	Add new environmental subjects within departments of agricultural and engineering universities, with a view to developing separate departments for environment.
	Make environmental specializations a priority for all postgraduate scholarships.
	Broaden the mandate gradually, while ensuring quality instruction, at specialized university departments in Faisalabad, Lahore, Karachi and Peshawar.
	Support the involvement of NGOs as the lead mode of non-formal education.
	Revise existing Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU) programs to include sustainable development concerns and establish new packages to address relevant conservation issues.

---

Focus non-formal education and basic literacy programmes on the immediate needs and issues of concern to people, with particular focus on population, health, hygiene, and conservation concerns.

---



### 3. Communicating the NCS

---

This section discusses awareness initiatives that have been undertaken in Pakistan to meet the objectives of the NCS.

To gauge the effectiveness of such campaigns, criteria need to be defined. The volume of funds invested in such campaigns may be considered one indicator of the level of commitment. However, it is not very reliable. For one thing, it is difficult to estimate the exact cost incurred on many mass awareness initiatives, particularly those related to the print media. NGOs such as the IUCN and WWF, which have in-house communications units, have developed a network with media practitioners who print news items and articles on sustainable development free of cost. A press release or briefing is often enough for adequate coverage of an issue in the press. Then, very often, the cost of the campaign does not reflect the size of the project or its impact. A case in point is the Kirthar National Park Highway Campaign (see **Section 3.1.7**). Although it was a high profile campaign, its cost was minimal, consisting of meeting and travel expenses, etc. Thus, the cost of awareness initiative does not necessarily reflect the level of commitment, the extent of awareness raised, or the effectiveness of the campaign.

A better criterion for assessing the awareness raised and environmental commitment, particularly with respect to the print media, is the extent of coverage in national newspapers and periodicals over time. **Exhibit 3.1** illustrates the rise in numbers of articles published, indicating the greater priority assigned by the press to issues regarding sustainable development. **Exhibit 3.1** provides information on the numbers of articles published under the heads of Agriculture, Environment and Energy. The Environment head contains articles on the 12 core NCS areas other than agriculture and energy.

Market research would be very useful in assessing such campaigns' effectiveness. To date, however, such research has not been carried out in the area of environment or sustainable development.

It is difficult to establish a direct linkage between mass awareness initiatives that have taken place and the NCS. Many environmental awareness activities in Pakistan did not profess a connection with the Strategy, although their objectives were in line with it. Likewise, government departments such as the forest and wildlife divisions do not directly refer to the NCS as a justification for their work. However, it is assumed that the NCS, as the government's overall strategy for sustainable development and the environment, propels all its activities in this field. It is also assumed that environmental NGOs use the NCS as a guideline for their projects.

Thus, the awareness initiatives discussed in this section are not directly linked to the NCS. They are relevant, rather, by virtue of having some of the objectives as the Strategy. It should also be noted that, due to the vastness of the topic under research, and the short time-span given for the study, not all the projects mentioned could be described in detail.



### 3.1 Communications Initiatives Linked to the NCS

Many initiatives have been undertaken in Pakistan to raise awareness of environmental issues through both formal and non-formal means. A sample of such campaigns is discussed below, highlighting the objective, indicating the sum of funds utilized where possible, the activities undertaken, and any reforms or institutional changes that may have come about as a direct result. To make the sample representative, campaigns run by the government, by NGOs, and jointly by the public and private sector, are included.

#### 3.1.1 Public Sector Initiatives

##### *Environmental Awareness Through the Use of Mass Media*

A report by an IUCN consultant, Omar Noman, emphasized the need for the government to formulate a coherent communications campaign on the environment, so that coordinated messages are sent out to the public and the limited resources available are used in the most efficient manner.

In 1992, the Ministry for Environment and Urban Affairs Division (EUAD) approved a project entitled “Environmental Awareness through the use of Mass Media” at a cost of Rs.10.28 million. This initiative launched a variety of activities through the print and electronic media, employing entertainment, such as theatre and cinema, and other means. Of the principles outlined for the campaign, the third states, “part of the media messages should be targeted to the priority projects selected for the first phase of NCS implementation.” During the project’s four-year span, 5 environmental movies were to be developed, mobile units were to be employed to take environmental films into rural areas, 10 one-minute publicity spots were to be developed and telecast, 5 television and 10 radio panel discussions were to be undertaken, and environmental publicity material, such as posters, stickers and pamphlets, were to be produced and disseminated. Apart from this, funds were to be invested in television and press activities during an ‘Environment Week.’ The responsibility for carrying out this project was transferred from the Ministry for the Environment and Urban Affairs Division to the NCS Unit. The allocation of funds for this project is shown in **Exhibit 3.2**.

During the project, 48-second television advertisements on marine pollution were telecast on the NTM and PTV channels; they cost Rs. 32,500 to produce and approximately Rs.1 million to air. Radio and television spots on the disadvantages of using plastic bags were also aired throughout 1995 at a cost of Rs.50,000 for production and, again, approximately Rs.1 million for broadcasting.

The NCS unit also held a poster competition based on the environment in the same year. Although the activity involved a small budget and targeted only schoolchildren, it had a significant impact in terms of awareness raising.

A campaign on smoke-emitting vehicles was launched using primarily hoardings at petrol stations for the target motorist audience. It sought to dissuade motorists from mixing engine oil into their vehicle fuel—a practice that increases smoke emissions. Flyers were distributed on this issue and the electronic media were also employed. This drive was further reinforced by traffic checking teams, which operated in major cities.

### ***Environmental Protection and Resource Conservation Project***

The Environmental Protection and Resource Conservation project (EPRC), funded by the World Bank, was a seven-year strategy concentrating on agriculture, natural resource management and environmental protection. It aimed to translate other strategies like the NCS into action. It is the first major public sector investment in the environment in Pakistan. This program contains five objectives, one of which is to disseminate information concerning damage to the environment and natural resources amongst policy makers, government officials and the public. One of the most important contributions of the project was that it raised awareness among key government officials in federal and provincial agencies, and to some extent, the general public.

A mass awareness specialist was hired and a strategy was developed and implemented through the electronic and print media. Activities included environmental mass awareness campaigns based on EPRC projects in Punjab, NWFP and AJK, as well as at the Federal level. With the Sindh-EPA, the EPRC project initiated environmental clubs in schools and prepared environmental education strategies for schools. The total cost incurred for the project's mass awareness component totaled almost Rs. 75m.

The Ministry of Environment, Local Government and Rural Development (MELGRD) was the key environmental agency in charge of overall policy making and coordination for this project. But the project's main weakness was considered to be MELGRD's lack of coordination with project implementing agencies, and lack of consultation with provincial departments which hindered the execution of activities. Decentralized planning and sector-wise investment would have ensured the effective flow of funds to government agencies that deal with the specific core areas of the NCS, eg, Forests Department, WAPDA, etc., and so, simpler projects at the provincial level would have been more successful.

Future operations as a result of this first phase are currently under consideration after the completion of this project. Of these, the mass awareness policy has been earmarked for extension throughout its field projects, with particular attention to grass roots awareness raising.

### ***Awareness Material Published by the Zoological Survey of Pakistan***

This Government Department publishes wildlife distribution maps of Pakistan and all the provinces with financial and technical assistance from PARC, PFI, provincial and wildlife departments, the AKRSP and NORAD. A book, "Cranes of Pakistan" was published with WWF-P, while booklets on "Houbara Bustard," "Ducks, Geese and Swans," "Edible Fishes of Pakistan," and "Hoofed Mammals of Pakistan" were published, in Urdu, using the departments own resources. The department also publishes a scientific journal of research papers on the biodiversity of Pakistan.

### ***Tree Plantation Campaigns***

The Ministry of Environment annually holds tree plantation campaigns during the spring and monsoon seasons. These occasions are spearheaded by either the Prime Minister or President, which generates great press coverage. The publicity is aimed to motivate the public to join the campaign, which involves the planting of millions of saplings. This

publicity strategy is designed to educate the masses on the planting and care of trees. All provincial forest departments and the Pakistan Forest Institute publish articles on tree planting through the Government Information Department. The Ministry of Information and Broadcasting cover the event through talk shows, documentaries, interviews, etc. Airtime is also given to this campaign in the news and current affairs programs.

Although figures for the funds spent on this activity were not available, the numbers of saplings planted over the last 10 years were. It appears that in the last two years the numbers have begun to decline due to the reduction in development funds allocated to the Provincial Forest Departments.

### **3.1.2 Private Sector Initiatives**

#### ***Environmental Technology Program for Industry***

The primary objective of the Environmental Technology Program for Industry (ETPI) is to promote the use of environment friendly technologies for the production of goods in Pakistan. Funded by the Netherlands Embassy and launched by the Federation of Pakistan Chambers of Commerce and Industry (FPCCI), this initiative contains a communication and dissemination component to raise awareness on the benefits of adopting and adapting to safer technology practices. This lays particular emphasis on the National Environmental Quality Standards (NEQS), the penalties to be enforced if these rules are violated, and the enforcement of ISO 14000 in export oriented industries. Workshops, seminars and the print media have been employed to generate a greater understanding of the need to incorporate this technology in the industry. The tannery, pulp and paper, sugar, cement, textile processing and fertilizer industries have been targeted particularly.

### **3.1.3 NGO Initiatives**

#### ***The Journalists Resource Centre***

The Journalists Resource Centre (JRC) was formed in 1988 from NCS seed money, to provide a database on the environment and a library of resource material. It has 2,000 books, journals and publications; collections of articles, videos and films; photographs; and other materials and is open to anyone, with a preference for media representatives. Its four broad objectives were to:

- ☞ Act as a central storehouse of information on environmental subjects, and to disseminate this to diverse target audiences (journalists, teachers, advertising agencies, scientists, government officials, etc.)
- ☞ Encourage the target audiences to take a greater interest in environmental matters, and to use the information available during their work
- ☞ Encourage more accurate reporting and representation of environmental issues
- ☞ Increase the visibility and profile of the NCS.

The JRC also provides training for journalists, radio and television producers, and managers and senior editors. Training workshops, for the press and for radio, have been

held and a desktop publishing center has been established to create bulletins on the environment, for distribution by NGOs. The JRC attempted to reach a much wider audience by using the Urdu press, radio and television, but there is a lack of research material in Urdu.

The JRC also seeks to publicize the objectives of the NCS. As the focal point of the NCS Communication Strategy, it works to build the capacity of the press, radio and television to report accurately on the country's environmental problems. Its work also includes applying NCS principles at the grassroots level—working with the media to improve their ability to report on the environment and to mobilize public support for the NCS.

To meet this end, the JRC held media workshops and seminars on the NCS, developed media kits, and published the actual NCS document. This, in addition to producing a film on the NCS, printing a quarterly NCS Bulletin which discussed initiatives being implemented under the NCS, and issuing 14 of the most influential sector papers on the NCS. The NCS Bulletin later became *The Way Ahead*, an investigative quarterly magazine on the issues concerning sustainable development. Urdu and Sindhi translations (*Pak Mahol* and *Jareeda*) followed soon after in 1993 to tap a wider and more rural audience. The JRC also produced an Urdu glossary of environmental terms for the Urdu and regional media.

JRC also plays the role of media watchdog, monitoring the environmental stories carried in the media, and training it to identify stories, and write and broadcast them in an improved manner. It has been successful in this role, as there has been an increase in the volume and quality of environmental coverage both in the English and the Urdu press (see **Exhibit 2.4**). JRC has also hosted workshops for radio and television producers to sensitize them to environmental concerns and to train them to highlight them in their work. All these activities were supported by JRC's extensive reference library.

Following the prescriptions laid out in the NCS, the JRC established an Urdu and regional languages unit, to disseminate the message of the NCS amongst a wider, more representative sample of the population.

The JRC is now the Communications Unit at IUCN-Karachi. The Communications unit no longer supports NCS activities directly, but instead is concerned with the communication activities of IUCN.

### ***The SPCS Ulema Project***

The National Research and Development Foundation (NRDF), in collaboration with the IUCN, undertook a plan to use the influence of religious leaders and clerics for environmental awareness. This project was called "Ulema and Environment." Using mosques, *madaris* and the *ulema* as a means of communication, the project aimed to harness the effectiveness of traditional mechanisms for environmental rehabilitation in Peshawar. This is in line with the SPCS communications strategy, which stresses the need to communicate messages of environmental conservation through intermediaries who have a direct contact with different sections of society. The SPCS Round Table on Communications and the MTR Mission on the SPCS also recommended a project involving the *ulema* for rehabilitation activities.

The project aimed to sensitize a corps of *ulema* to the environment and environmental issues so that they could impart these concerns to others, specifically through religious gatherings and teachings. This would be supported by verses from the Koran and the sayings of the Prophet (PBUH), and practical exercises. This initiative is of particular importance because enrollment rates are low throughout the NWFP, and the few who do go to school, rarely make it beyond basic education.<sup>7</sup> The *ulema*, however, are a sector of society that has access to the majority of the population, and exercise a heavy influence on their ideals.

The project aimed to sensitize the *ulema* to environmental issues with a view to their imparting this knowledge at the grass roots level where they have most influence. The Koran and Hadith were used as a foundation for their teachings. Research was undertaken to select pertinent verses from the Holy Scriptures and sayings of the Prophet. Female *ulema* were also involved in the project, which meant that the women of the area were not marginalised from a development initiative, as is often the case in a traditional society.

### ***The Houbara Bustard Campaign***

The Houbara Bustard issue has generated more press coverage and public debate than any other environmental issue in recent times, dealing not only with biodiversity and conservation, but also with development, legality and even nationalism.

In the Middle Eastern states, the houbara bustard has become extinct due to excessive hunting. Middle Eastern dignitaries now travel to Pakistan's Sindh and Balochistan provinces to hunt the bird there. The scale and level of the hunt is huge and unsustainable for the bird population. What is more alarming is that the houbara is considered a threatened species and is protected by a ban on its hunting. Also, the houbara falls under the protection of CITES (Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Flora and Fauna), but these birds and their parts are widely exported. It is the Ministry of the Interior that invites these guests to hunt the bird each year, and in doing so, waives all restrictions connected to the hunting of this species. However, this laxity is not extended to local hunters, who are prosecuted if caught hunting the houbara. The argument is that the visitors actually invest in local development initiatives (eg, schools, hospitals, and income) and the Government wishes to secure friendly relations with its Arab friends.

The WWF-P was at the forefront of raising awareness for this issue. Its extensive public awareness program included press releases, newspaper articles, and advertisements in the press, press conferences, protest walks and lobbying other NGOs and the government. It was one of the first times that the press had been used for highlighting a conservation issue, and it achieved its aim. The Society for the Conservation and Protection of the Environment (SCOPE) issued press releases, participated in interviews, and wrote articles for the press and magazines. It successfully secured judgements against some of the better known foreign hunters, which in turn had a sizeable impact in mobilizing public interest and opinion for the houbara issue.

---

<sup>7</sup> *Sarhad Provincial Conservation Strategy*, IUCN-Pakistan, 1996

The IUCN concentrated on enabling the media to write research-based stories by providing information, undertaking research on behalf of the press, and helping the media gain access to experts.

In addition, a large number of other NGOs and community based organizations (CBOs) and journalists were actively involved in campaigns, to the extent that by 1993, the houbara bustard was making front-page news. This annual campaign continues, and from 1991 to date approximately Rs. 2.5 million have been spent on protecting the future of this species. It is the closest that Pakistan has to a systematic awareness-raising program.

Although neither the hunting nor the smuggling of this bird has stopped, the awareness campaign about the plight of these avifauna resulted in the establishment of a rehabilitation center in Sindh for those birds caught being smuggled out of the country. These birds are usually undernourished and in a state of fear when they are taken to the center, where they are nursed back to health and released into their habitat.

### ***The Kirthar National Park Highway Campaign***

This campaign to prevent the Indus Highway from being directed into the Kirthar National Park is one of the few examples where NGOs, public advocacy groups, the press and ordinary citizens rallied together for an environmental cause. The issue was of particular importance as it was in direct conflict with a development project. Although not as large as the houbara bustard issue, this campaign nevertheless generated a lot of interest.

The English press media contributed greatly to raising and sustaining awareness about the issue with almost daily articles in some leading papers. This was facilitated by the role of NGOs as sources of verified research and information.

The IUCN and WWF-P regularly provided articles and press updates, as well as undertaking mediation roles and lobbying the government. SCOPE also issued press releases, and at the same time successfully petitioned the Sindh High Court to issue orders preventing the construction of the highway. The Aurat Foundation organized a nationwide petition and a walk for Kirthar on World Environment Day, which was widely covered in the media. The media's active reporting of NGO activity was crucial in ensuring that pressure remained on the groups interested in building the highway through Kirthar National Park.

Eventually, the Prime Minister directed the Indus Highway Authority to find an alternative route. The media (i.e., press, television and radio) was used to issue statements confirming this. This was the first instance where the pressure of civil society forced the government to rethink its options and overturn a project against its will.

## **3.2 Environmental Education Initiatives under the NCS**

Fewer initiatives have been undertaken in environmental education than in communications, and even fewer in the formal education sector, although informally, activities such as poster competitions and nature clubs are popular.

Some of the campaigns are discussed below, highlighting the objective, indicating the sum of funds utilized where possible, the activities undertaken and any reforms or

institutional changes that may have come about as a direct result. To make the sample representative, campaigns run by the government, the private sector, and jointly by the public and private sector are highlighted.

**Exhibit 3.4** lists educational institutions that offer environment related courses.

### **3.2.1 Public Sector Initiatives**

#### ***Pakistan Environmental Protection Council Nature Clubs***

The Pakistan Environmental Protection Council (PEPC) and EUAD decided to encourage educational institutions (colleges/institutions) to set up environmental clubs. The Ministry of Environment's NCS Unit was requested to instruct each provincial Education Department to open nature clubs in educational institutions. The eight universities that fell under the University Grants Commission were given a sum of Rs10,000 as seed money to set up their clubs.

This was a small-scale, ill-planned activity. The clubs were registered with the Ministry on being set up. Progress reports were to be submitted, with a write-up on activities achieved. The then Chairman was keen to see quick initiatives set up for environmental mass awareness and encouraged this drive. Unfortunately, follow up activities were overlooked, and so, although the clubs were established on paper, they did not become functional in reality.

Similarly, a directive by the government was sent out in Sindh, requesting that nature clubs be established in schools. Overnight 7000 clubs were established, but again, only on paper (*pers. comm.* Nargis Alavi and Ali Raza Rizvi).

#### ***Coordinated Environmental Education Programme***

In 1986 the Ministry of Education and the EUAD, with assistance from the South Asian Co-operative Environment Programme and UNESCO launched the Coordinated Environmental Education Programme (CEEP) to incorporate environmental education into the formal education sector. This program was aimed at training teachers, educators, decision-makers, and planners. It also involved curriculum research, the production and testing of environmental education kits and materials, and better liaison with national, regional and international agencies in the field.

With funds of approximately Rs.4 m from 1986 to 1993, the CEEP held a number of teacher training workshops, had the syllabi and textbooks of primary and middle classes revised for greater environmental content, and prepared three teachers manuals on environment for primary, middle and secondary school teachers.

A pioneering project in Pakistan, CEEP's culmination in 1993, led to a number of recommendations for future environmental education activities which included amongst others, a follow-up program based on CEEP; more workshops for teachers on the environment with a pool of experienced resource persons conducting them; sufficient resource material on environmental education and their regular up-date.

### ***The Teachers Training Manual***

In 1992 the Ministry of Education began a directive to bring environmental education into the Certificate of Teaching (CT) and Postgraduate Teaching Certificate (PTC) curriculum and syllabus. In these, a unit (no. 7) was allocated to environmental education.

After examining this unit it was felt that the component required further development to meet the real needs of the teachers and students. There was also a need to develop material and study aids on local issues that can easily be internalized by both the teacher and the student.

Therefore, IUCN's Education Unit, together with St. Patrick's College of Elementary Education in Karachi, the government's recognized agency for imparting CT and PCT training, forged a partnership to review and design the curriculum for environmental education in CT/PTC courses with a view to developing a new syllabus with supporting resource material.

The result was the Teachers Training Manual for Classes I-VI, a guide for educators on how to incorporate environmental education into daily school teaching. The manual, to be used with the curriculum, contains information on the environment, helps lesson planning, gives examples on how environmental education can be included in biology, islamiyat, etc., and a resource pack.

This document was to be submitted to the Bureaux of Curricula for trial, but the Bureaux requested the IUCN to test the module in the private sector. Hence, this module was successfully tested in the Northern Areas' College of Education at the CT, PTC and BED. level. The document has yet to be resubmitted to the Bureaux for incorporation into the curriculum.

### ***Recent Environmental Educational Change***

Recently, the Punjab University introduced a Diploma on Environmental Science while Kinnaird College initiated a Masters in Environmental Science. These will add to the existing courses on agriculture, applied zoology, livestock management, wildlife, etc., in the country. **Exhibit 3.2** lists the names and departments of educational institutions currently offering courses related to the environment.

#### **3.2.2 Private Sector Initiatives**

##### ***The Aga Khan University School of Nursing***

The Aga Khan University School of Nursing (AKUSON), a model in nursing education, approached IUCN with an interest in incorporating environmental education into their curriculum. A workshop was held at AKUSON with the objective of discussing the environment, to bring a change at the individual, family and community level for improvement in environmental health, and to enhance the skills and attitude of the staff at AKUSON regarding environmental awareness.

From this workshop, AKUSON developed a strategy with IUCN, on incorporating the lessons learnt. This led to the development of a program to integrate environmental



education into the nursing program. AKUSON has now internalized this training by ensuring that the School itself has trained personnel in environmental education who in turn, impart environmental education to new trainees.

### **3.2.3 NGO Initiatives**

#### ***Gulistan and Hamara Mahol***

The Teachers Resource Centre (TRC) in Karachi, a center for training in-service teachers, did not originally include the environment in its training. However, with funding from IUCN and WWF-P, the TRC began producing an 8-page quarterly publication in Urdu on environmental issues for its in-service teachers. It provides supplementary information and suggests ways of integrating environmental education into daily teaching. The content is thoroughly researched and the language is simple and easy to understand. Despite the fact that the funding discontinued a few years ago, the Center continues to publish the magazine from its own sources. Since publishing this journal, the environment has become an indirect focus of the TRC's work, specifically in awareness raising. The IUCN Education Section also works extensively on the preparation of textbooks, in partnership with the TRC.

*Hamara Mahol*, an Urdu publication by *Shirkat Gah*, focuses not only on the environment, but also on cross sectoral issues such as health, women, etc. It is a spin-off from the NCS.

#### ***Curriculum Development in the Northern Areas***

The NACS Unit held a workshop with government teachers and practitioners of the Northern Areas to develop a curriculum for primary classes. This resulted in the development of a framework for an Environmental Education curriculum for primary classes. The Directorate of Education, Northern Areas, has endorsed the newly formed curriculum and has sent it to the Federal curriculum Wing for final approval and incorporation into textbooks.

#### ***Spellathon***

WWF-Pakistan has one of the largest environmental education programs in the country. Apart from established practices of raising environmental awareness such as material development, teacher training workshops, etc., one of its more innovative approaches is its annual "Spellathon" campaign. This is basically a spelling campaign arranged to generate funds that are invested into WWF conservation initiatives. Children from Classes VI to X are asked to undertake a spelling test on words related to the environment. For each correct spelling, they are awarded a cash prize by the campaign sponsors. This campaign began as a trial phase in 1996. Carried out primarily in Lahore, it involved 45 schools and generated approximately Rs. 800,000. This year, 175 schools nationwide are participating, and it is expected that Rs.3million will be collected. Corporate organizations such as Levi's, Nestle, Habib Oil, English Biscuits, Chase Manhattan Bank, NIDO are sponsoring the event.

**Exhibit 3.1:** Press Coverage of Environmental Issues from 1992-1999

**Exhibit 3.2:** Allocation of Funds for the “Environmental Awareness through the use of Mass Media” Project

<i>Year</i>	<i>Allocation as per PC-1 (in rupees)</i>	<i>Actual Allocation (in rupees)</i>	<i>Utilization (in rupees)</i>
1994-94	5 m	4.528 m	3.167 m
1995-96	4.5 m	4.5 m	4.100 m
1996-97	5.5 m	3 m	3 m
1997-98	4.359 m	5 m	5 m

**Exhibit 3.3: Awareness Raising Campaigns**

<i>Campaign</i>	<i>Medium Used</i>	<i>Executing Agency</i>	<i>Coverage</i>
Boiling Water	Print and Electronic Media	MELGRD	National
Ciba-Geigy Plant Fire	Print Media	Press	National
Conservation of Khanpur Haveli	Photographic Exhibition	Mehnaz Akbar	Local
Conservation of Mohatta Palace	Print Media		National
Conservation of Sardar Sujan Singh Gurdwara	Photographic Exhibition	Mehnaz Akbar	Local
Crane Conservation	Print Media	Society for the Protection of Environment and community development, Peshawar, WWF-Pakistan	Local
Environmental Pollution and Eye Disease	Print Media	Civil Hospital Eye Department, Karachi	Local
Environmental Technology Programme for Industry	Print Media	Federation of Pakistan's Chambers of Commerce and Industry	National
Falcon Smuggling	Print Media	Falcon Foundation	National
Family Planning	Print and Electronic Media	Family Association of Pakistan	National
Fish-poaching	Print Media	Government of Sindh and Balochistan	Local
Ghazi Barotha Dam	Print and Electronic Media		National
Houbara Bustard	Print Media	Houbara Bustard Foundation, WWF-Pakistan	National
Improvement of Urban Industrial Environment	Print Media	Government of NWFP/GTZ	Local
Juniper Forest	Print Media		National
Kasur Tanneries	Print and Electronic Media		National
Kirthar National Park Highway	Print Media	SDPI, WWF-Pakistan, IUCN, Sindh Wildlife Department	National

**Exhibit 3.3: Awareness Raising Campaigns (Contd.)**

<i>Campaign</i>	<i>Medium Used</i>	<i>Executing Agency</i>	<i>Coverage</i>
Lead in Underground Water	Print Media	Pakistan Council for Scientific and Industrial Research, Peshawar	Local
Margalla Hills National Park	Print Media	IUCN, Capital Development Authority	Local
Marine Pollution	Electronic Media	MELGRD	National
Moving Environmental Film Festival	Telemedia	WWF-Pakistan, Trust for the Environment	National
National Environmental Quality Standards	Print and Electronic Media	MELGRD	National
Pakistan's Forest Cover and Rate of Deforestation	Print Media	WWF-Pakistan	National
Plastic Bag	Electronic Media	MELGRD	National
Polluted Hadiara Drain	Print and Electronic Media	WWF-Pakistan	National
Population Control	Print Media	United Nations Population Fund	National
Premier Shell Gas Exploration in Kirthar National Park	Print Media	SDPI, WWF-Pakistan, IUCN, Sindh Wildlife Department	National
Ravi Alkalis Technology Transfer	Print Media	Press, SDPI, WWF-Pakistan, IUCN, Greenpeace	National
Rickshaw	Electronic Media	MELGRD	National
Sabz Zaitoon	Print Media	IUCN	National
Smoke Emitting Vehicles	Print and Electronic Media	MELGRD	National
Tree Plantation	Electronic Media	Forest Department, Government of Pakistan	National
World Environment Day	Print and Electronic Media	MELGRD	National
World Population Day	Print and Electronic Media	Ministry of Population Welfare	National
Zoonotic Diseases	Print Media	Animal Biotechnology Veterinary Research Institute, Karachi	Local

**Exhibit 3.4: Universities and Institutions Offering Environment Programs**

Agricultural University, Faisalabad
Agricultural university, Peshawar
Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad
Centre for Energy and Environment Studies, Ghulam Ishaq Khan Institute of Engineering Sciences and Technology, Topi (TOPI)
Department of Environment Planning and Management, University of Peshawar
HEJ Research Institute of Organic Chemistry, University of Karachi
Institute of Biochemistry and Biotechnology, University of the Punjab, Lahore
Institute of Educational Development, Aga Khan University, Karachi
Institute of Environmental Engineering and Management, Mehran University of Engineering and Technology
Institute of Environmental Engineering and Research, University of Engineering and Technology (UET), Lahore
Institute of Environmental Engineering, National University of Science and Technology, Rawalpindi
Institute of Environmental Engineering, NED Engineering University, Karachi
Jamshoro Engineering University, Hyderabad
Kinnaird College, Lahore
National Institute of Public Administration
Pakistan Academy of Rural Development
Pakistan Forest Institute, Peshawar
Quaid-e-Azam University, Islamabad
University of Balochistan, Quetta



## 4. Recommendations for the MTR

---

HBP would like to put forth the following recommendations for the MTR team.

Wherever the NCS has been unable to achieve its targets, the major reason appears to be confusion as to its ownership and lack of coordination with relevant government agencies. To prevent this from happening in the future, the NCS Unit should involve the ministries and government departments concerned with environment related work and consult them for all activities that affect their work. Also, before campaigns are designed, the opinions and priorities of these ministries and departments should be sought. This will not only help achieve a wider range of activities, but will also create a sense of ownership of the NCS—something that was felt to be lacking in the public sector, particularly in the departments and agencies that have priorities falling within the NCS’s core areas.

It is also important to develop greater coordination between the federal and provincial government departments on environmental issues.

An important area that requires investment is the building of mass awareness creation capacity in institutions concerned with sustainable development. However, again, the government sector—individual government divisions in particular—feel that they have not been given adequate, if any, training in awareness raising. For example, some provincial wildlife departments have dedicated publicity cells, but scarce resources and lack of expertise to carry out awareness campaigns render them ineffective. During discussions, some government officers complained that their ability to undertake campaigns had not been improved although the government is the chief implementing agency of the NCS. Conversely, they said, the capacity of NGOs—which are transient institutions in comparison to the government—has been strengthened, though this should have been a lower priority if the initiatives are to be made sustainable.

Finally, investment in research for development is generally on the decline in the public sector. Without research, it is unlikely that environmental issues can be highlighted effectively in subsequent awareness campaigns.

### 4.1 Communications

It has been discussed earlier that the Communications Strategy originally designed by the NCS is now redundant and lacks ownership. This strategy should be revised in light of the NCS Unit’s experience with mass awareness and, more importantly, using the research conducted to devise the provincial strategies’ communications components. This will at the same time ensure that government departments and provincial governments, particularly, accept responsibility for the strategy.



#### **4.1.1 Press**

The print media is one area where the NCS has been successful in awareness creation. Coverage of environmental issues has increased and, on some occasions, they have hit the front page. However, the Ministry of Environment, Local Government and Rural Development (MELGRD) has not taken full advantage of the government's own information department to disseminate information, particularly its press service, the Associated Press of Pakistan. A strategy can be devised with these departments to ensure that regular items are sent out to the public. This approach will keep the topic of sustainable development permanently in the press, rather than only when headline news is published.

#### **4.1.2 Television and Video Production**

Although it is urban based, television cuts across the literacy and class barriers. Hence, it is an excellent mode of communication for the business communities, students, urban elite, and decision-makers. However, video production can target the same audience that television does, but, at the same time, can also be used in extension work with rural audiences. Investment in video production and subsequent schemes to facilitate its outreach would target members of the population who are distant from the mainstream media.

#### **4.1.3 Radio**

As with the press (See 4.1.1), MELGRD should exploit the in-house government facility of the Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation. Again, a strategy can be devised to air more programs and messages on the radio, particularly by using the air time the government gives to its departments at concessionary rates.

#### **4.1.4 Other**

Seminars and workshops, like videos, are sophisticated mediums for use in extension work with decision-makers. Greater investment should be made in them.

Hoardings, general advertising and endorsement campaigns by public figures are a useful means of communications, particularly in a developing nation where hero worship is commonplace in the younger generation.

Posters are popular and are perhaps one of the cheapest and most effective ways of bringing environmental messages to the homes, schools and workplaces of the masses.

In order to assess behavioral change as a result of mass awareness drives, a market survey needs to be carried out. No such research has been undertaken to date. Without this, reviews will not be able to measure their achievements.

### **4.2 Environmental Education**

An environmental education strategy has not been drafted so far. However, the provincial strategies that have been developed and can be merged to form a national education strategy, based on implementation experience. This way, the strategy will be a

practical one that is utilized, and will not meet the same fate as the communications strategy did.

Efforts of the Ministry of Education and the NCS have to a large extent concentrated on public sector education, with the intention to change or rather redesign the curriculum. However, the thriving private education sector, which contains 52-54 percent of school-going children, must also be taken into account (*pers. comm.* Nargis Alavi). The private sector can be of particular significance for bringing environmental education into teaching practices, as it is more open to new ideas, has greater resources for teacher training, and better systems of evaluating the impacts of education.